

# **Non-Elect Salvation Possibility**

**Jonathan Ramachandran**

---

## **Reflection**

It's God's gift to be aware that something is seriously wrong even if no one else at church realized it as Martin Luther did. Next comes courage to speak up and stand with God's Word in the Bible even it means to risk one's life in the process. Little would Luther have realized that his actions would lead to the entire protestant movement today which is like 2 in 5 Christians (40% of Christians) fulfilling the Great Commission! God's Hand upon Luther's life shows that despite his weaknesses, God saves him (and us likewise) giving empirical assurance of the wideness in the mercy of God unto salvation in Christ for those who believe in Lord Jesus.

## **Introduction**

Martin Luther wrote 95 theses against the Roman Catholic church seeking to reform it from extra-biblical practices <sup>1</sup>. The fruit of it is the protestant movement today which continues to strive to achieve Biblical perfection as evidenced by the various denominations associated with it. Though united in some sense, the protestant movement is also divided by theological understanding and practice. Personally, I believe that these divisions in the church are necessary to show who is approved and not<sup>2</sup>. The Gospel is not preaching about Christ only but also preaching what He said to avoid lawlessness. In the great denial, many claim to have done the gift of prophesying, casting

---

<sup>1</sup>Stephen J. Nichols, *Martin Luther's 95 Theses*. Presbyterian & Reformed Pub Co, USA, 2002.

<sup>2</sup>1 Corinthians 11:18 – 19.

out demons and miracles in His name but He declares “*I never knew you!*” and the way to avoid it is declared immediately as “*hears these sayings of Mine, and does them*”<sup>3</sup>. Here is a single reform which I would like to bring or amplify in Christianity.

## **1. Sola Unity in Diversity**

There are three harvests of the Gospel indicating levels of obedience to the Word of God (hence reward) namely the thirtyfold, sixtyfold and hundredfold levels<sup>4</sup>. This means that Christians can have error and hence varying levels of obedience according to the measure of faith gifted by God<sup>5</sup>.

### **1.1 Balance between tolerance and doctrinal friction**

Since the measure of faith is determined by God here, no point in trying to force or convince another Christian regarding something they may never be able to understand nor accept even if you turned out right. Having this understanding increases tolerance and removes unwanted friction among Christians.

I believe that each step toward accuracy is proof of a closer relationship with God and He allows freewill to reward those who diligently seek Him. I do not agree in theological shaming practices though one is free to express strongly. This means that we leave the judgment part to God but continue to work together in Christian unity to love another for the parts which we agree. It is sad that some Christians end up boycotting each other from ministry and jobs even just because they do not see eye to eye on theology or practice. Hence this freedom is important so that we make no one stumble from our doctrinal

---

<sup>3</sup> Matthew 7:21 – 24.

<sup>4</sup> Matthew 13:8, Matthew 19:29 calls hundredfold level as a final reward context.

<sup>5</sup> Romans 12:3, 6.

stance whilst letting God Judge or reward other Christians accordingly<sup>6</sup>.

Deeper unity is shown only when we as Christians are able to fellowship alongside other Christians whom we do not agree on all points doctrinally. We can refrain from participating in practices which contradicts our personal stance but that should not stop us from working together in ministry on grounds which we agree. This way, each Christian can maintain his/her unique perspectives. Differences in doctrine which are allowed should only affect variation in final rewards and not risk anyone's salvation. Hence heretical thoughts cannot be admitted into our discussions as we are to be holy in words and thoughts too.

## **1.2 Lord Jesus' Parable of the Wheat and Tares**

Christ actually taught even greater tolerance to be held in His Church by even welcoming the tares into it without doing any filtering until the end of the age. This Gospel model of both wheat and tares growing together<sup>7</sup> but separated at the end of the age when He returns is what God's Will is and so we ought to run our Church according to His pre-defined method here. The danger stated in this parable is that if one tries to remove the tares, it can even *uproot out a wheat* meaning some talented and good Christians can end up being removed from ministry and so such Christian leadership will be held accountable for such negligence and loss. I will cite one early Church father for this claim which I believe explains the reason why Christ asked not to separate out the wheat and tares is because of freewill since some may be tares today but can be wheat tomorrow after repentance. Hence the Church needs to be aware of this to be a cradle for repentance for such ones in case this change happens as St. Irenaeus of Lyons (c. 130 AD – c. 202 AD) writes, "*but man, being endowed with reason, and in this respect like to God,*

---

<sup>6</sup> Romans 14:4.

<sup>7</sup> Matthew 13:28 – 29's Parable of the Wheat and the Tares.

*having been made free in his will, and with power over himself, is himself the cause to himself, that sometimes he becomes wheat, and sometimes chaff* ”<sup>8</sup>. If God can allow the original churches to be wrong for at least 1000 years (i.e. between 500 AD to 1500 AD), we must be also aware that our local church or interpretation of doctrine and prophecy could be wrong on some parts too. Let God judge which Christian, or denomination will turn out right but we can present our studies, opinions and early Christian quotes in support of our position. The doctrinal grid line where this boundary is drawn in history that is unanimously agreed across protestant, catholic and orthodox circles is the *Apostle’s Creed* and *Nicene Creed* (325 AD) <sup>9</sup> where the latter is more recognized. This boundary line is important so that we protect the church from heretical thoughts.

### **1.3 Non-elect Salvation Possibility**

St. Gregory Nazianzus (c. 329 AD – c. 390 AD) writes, “*then here too I will provide thee with broad paths. Philosophize about the world or worlds; about matter; about soul; about natures endowed with reason, good or bad; about resurrection, about judgment, about reward, or the Sufferings of Christ. For in these subjects to hit the mark is not useless, and to miss it is not dangerous. But with God we shall have converse, in this life only in a small degree; but a little later, it may be, more perfectly, in the Same, our Lord Jesus Christ, to Whom be glory for ever. Amen.*” <sup>10</sup> This quote seems to allow variation of doctrine in the topic of “Judgment” where the major historical positions for the

---

<sup>8</sup> Schaff, Philip, *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, Christian Literature Publishing Co, USA, 1885: Volume I (St. Irenaeus of Lyons, *Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 4) [www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf01.ix.vi.v.html](http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf01.ix.vi.v.html)

<sup>9</sup> Schaff, Philip, *Ante-Nicene Fathers: NPNF2-14*, Christian Literature Publishing Co, USA, 1885. *The Seven Ecumenical Councils*, 34, [www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/npnf214.html](http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/npnf214.html)

<sup>10</sup> St. Gregory Nazianzus, *First Theological Oration* (Oration 27), Point IX, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/310227.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/310227.htm)

damned are eternal hell <sup>11</sup>, annihilation <sup>12</sup> or Christ centered universalism. <sup>13</sup>

So speculating on the topic of "judgment" will not save anyone nor condemn them but may make a difference in "rewards" according to St. Gregory here. Martin Luther has demonstrated that a thought followed by a majority no matter even for 1000 years and did full evangelism to fulfil the great commission during those time still can be wrong!

In order to not misquote St. Gregory's meaning about what he meant about "judgment" context here, his other quotes seem to point to either universalism or more accurately, some type of *non-elect salvation* <sup>14</sup> possibility. St. Gregory writes, "*Let these men then if they will, follow our way, which is Christ's way; but if they will not, let them go their own. Perhaps in it they will be baptized with Fire, in that last Baptism which is more painful and longer, which devours wood like grass, 1 Corinthians 3:12-19 and consumes the stubble of every evil.*" <sup>15</sup>

## **2.0 Detailed Exploration of Non-elect Salvation Possibility Example**

This topic is of utmost importance to discuss because it deals with prophecy and we ought to identify why there is a divergence of thought in regard to the fate of non-Christians in Christian historical thought. Notice that St. Gregory's quote earlier is pointing to the context of 1 Corinthians 3:15's "saved

---

<sup>11</sup> Paul Helm, *The Last Things: Death, Judgment, Heaven and Hell*. Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 1989.

<sup>12</sup> LeRoy Edwin Froom. *The Conditionalist Faith of Our Fathers*, 2 vols. Washington, DC: Review and Herald, 1965.

<sup>13</sup> Richard Bauckham. *Universalism: A Historical Survey*. Themelios 4, no. 2, January 1979.

<sup>14</sup> "Non Elect Salvation" is a phrase I invented to classify such quotes from Church Fathers which seem to point to some saved in the spirit world usually after a judgment of fire in hell. It may not be full universalism as these same fathers seem to have strong eternal hell or annihilation quotes usually too hence a term to quantify these "saved from hell" ones is what "non elect salvation" term means.

<sup>15</sup> St. Gregory Nazianzus, *Oration 39*, Chapter XIX, Oration on the Holy Lights, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/310239.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/310239.htm)

by fire” <sup>16</sup> case not for Christians but novation heretics who are not following Christ’s way but their own way which is why I see it as a non-elect salvation possibility.

If I may comment further, let’s map this verse to the three harvests of the gospel from “good ground” (meaning Christians) in the parable of the sower, namely the thirtyfold, sixtyfold and hundredfold reward levels. Wouldn’t these honoured Christians be mapped to the ones with reward case mentioned in 1 Corinthians 3:14 <sup>17</sup> instead of the “saved by fire” type of 1 Corinthians 3:15 whose works are burned fully? I mean even the lowest reward thirtyfold level seems to match 1 Corinthians 3:14’s “reward” case of being honoured rather than the “saved by fire” with “no reward” possibility of 1 Corinthians 3:15. If viewed like this, then 1 Corinthians 3:15’s “saved by fire” case could be non-elect salvation.

In regard to the common objection that these cases refer to Christians only based on 1 Corinthians 3:11 <sup>18</sup>, this can refer to those non-Christians who have done some commands of God in their lives as per the conscience given to every man rule in Romans 2:6 – 11 <sup>19</sup>. This is commonly referred to as a special case for those who never heard of the Gospel in Romans 2:14 – 16 <sup>20</sup> (the word “Law” used in same context here). Can we say

---

<sup>16</sup> 1 Corinthians 3:15, “If anyone’s work is burned, he will suffer loss; but he himself will be saved, yet so as through fire” (NKJV).

<sup>17</sup> 1 Corinthians 3:14, “If anyone’s work which he has built on *it* endures, he will receive a reward” (NKJV).

<sup>18</sup> 1 Corinthians 3:11 “For no other foundation can anyone lay than that which is laid, which is Jesus Christ” (NKJV).

<sup>19</sup> Romans 2:6 – 11, “6who “will render to each one according to his deeds”: 7eternal life to those who by patient continuance in doing good seek for glory, honor, and immortality; 8but to those who are self-seeking and do not obey the truth, but obey unrighteousness—indignation and wrath, 9tribulation and anguish, on every soul of man who does evil, of the Jew first and also of the Greek; 10but glory, honor, and peace to everyone who works what is good, to the Jew first and also to the Greek. 11For there is no partiality with God” (NKJV).

<sup>20</sup> Romans 2:14 – 16, “14for when Gentiles, who do not have the law, by nature do the things in the law, these, although not having the law, are a law to themselves, 15who show the work of the law written in their hearts, their conscience also bearing witness, and between themselves their thoughts accusing or else excusing them) 16in the day when God will judge the secrets of men by Jesus Christ, according to my gospel” (NKJV).

that those who were “excused” on judgment day based on this unlearnt case as being saved by works since they never believed in Christ nor heard of Him even or accuse that these are saved by works? Doesn’t it also show that Christ’s Perfect Blood and Atonement can be applied to such unlearnt ones in the Spirit World to be saved?

I am writing like this to show why such Church Fathers may have taught differently using this same Verse because its interpretation can be difficult.

## **2.1 Unlearnt and Learnt Cases**

Notice that in comparison, Romans 2:12 – 13 <sup>21</sup> points not to this unlearnt case but learnt case since it reads “hearers of the Law (gospel)” can be “justified” if they “did the works of the Law (Gospel commands)” which could be the “saved by fire” case of 1 Corinthians 3:15 earlier. Also, if any person with faith in Christ must be able to get a minimum reward for faith which would assign him to 1 Corinthians 3:14’s reward case for it is hard to conceive that a person with faith gets zero rewards and is saved by fire as mentioned in 1 Corinthians 3:15 since faith itself is a great thing, isn’t it? Also, faith without works would be dead <sup>22</sup> meaning that any person with a living faith (hence a Christian) must be 1 Corinthians 3:14’s honoured reward case, right?

I am writing this not to confuse you but to honestly present the deeper thoughts which arise when we map these verses to each other. Just like the unlearnt case requires such saved ones to see and believe in Lord Jesus Christ in the Spirit World, such “saved by fire” case ones of 1 Corinthians 3:15 also may refer to this class of “believing after seeing” case of John 6:29, 36, 40

---

<sup>21</sup> Romans 2:12 – 13, “12For as many as have sinned without law will also perish without law, and as many as have sinned in the law will be judged by the law 13(for not the hearers of the law are just in the sight of God, but the doers of the law will be justified;” (NKJV).

<sup>22</sup> James 2:26 “For as the body without the spirit is dead, so faith without works is dead also” (NKJV).

<sup>23</sup> where Christ was only angry with the Jews for not believing Him even after seeing Him and His miracles and other works. The context of seeing the Risen Christ and then given a chance to believe is also evidenced in Apostle St. Thomas' conversion too <sup>24</sup>.

Whether this is a misguided interpretation or accurate truth is open to debate and this particular topic of *non-elect salvation* is something I was attracted to from the writings of such earliest Church Fathers. How would it be fair to Christians then to believe here on earth and not in the Spirit World?

## 2.2 Chiliasm Church Fathers

There are some fascinating quotes in certain earliest Church Fathers whom I call the *Chiliasm Church Fathers* which support the idea that Christians participate in the first resurrection and reign with Christ as “kings and priests” for 1000 years in a sinless human body <sup>25</sup> which happens at the old earth and old heavens. At the end of this Millennial Reign of Christ, at the last trumpet, *Chiliasm Church Fathers* prophesy that there is a change from that “sinless human body” into “something angelic or heavenly but no more flesh and blood” in order to inherit the final new heaven <sup>26</sup>.

It is interesting in light of the fact that “no prophecy of Scripture is of any private interpretation” <sup>27</sup> and here we find *Chiliasm Church Fathers* clearly viewing the “change in the twinkling of

---

<sup>23</sup> John 6:29, 36, 40, “29Jesus answered and said to them, “This is the work of God, that you believe in Him whom He sent.” 36But I said to you that you have seen Me and yet do not believe. 40And this is the will of Him who sent Me, that everyone who sees the Son and believes in Him may have everlasting life; and I will raise him up at the last day.” (NKJV).

<sup>24</sup> John 20:29, “Jesus said to him, “Thomas, because you have seen Me, you have believed. Blessed *are* those who have not seen and *yet* have believed.” (NKJV).

<sup>25</sup> Revelation 1:6, 5:10, 20:4 – 6.

<sup>26</sup> Revelation 21:1, “1Now I saw a new heaven and a new earth, for the first heaven and the first earth had passed away. Also there was no more sea” (NKJV).

<sup>27</sup> 2 Peter 1:20, “knowing this first, that no prophecy of Scripture is of any private interpretation,” (NKJV)



an eye, at the last trumpet” prophecy <sup>28</sup> not as rapture which is at the start of the 1000 years when Christ Returns but to this great mystery of Christ becoming one flesh with His Bride (the Church) <sup>29</sup>. This interpretation supports the *non-elect salvation* possibility because in the last chapters of the Bible, we see that the Bride (Church) from heaven <sup>30</sup> is mentioned differently from the “nations who are saved” <sup>31</sup> where the former is no more flesh and blood having celestial (heavenly) resurrection bodies after this “change” while the latter are saved with “human or terrestrial (earthly)” bodies <sup>32</sup> only and not all enter heaven in that final earth after judgment day since the book of life results have been revealed too. It is not my purpose to write fully about this topic in this paper but do allow me to share a few more brief points.

### **2.3 Chiasm Prophecy regarding Change from Human to Angelic**

In the last chapter of the Bible, the Bride (Christians) seems to call “others” to be saved and take the “Water of Life” freely <sup>33</sup>. Notice that Christians were raised as humans for 1000 years to be repaid in the same old earth and heavens where they

---

<sup>28</sup> 1 Corinthians 15:52, “in a moment, in the twinkling of an eye, at the last trumpet. For the trumpet will sound, and the dead will be raised incorruptible, and we shall be changed” (NKJV).

<sup>29</sup> Ephesians 5:31 – 32, “and the two shall become one flesh.” <sup>32</sup>This is a great mystery, but I speak concerning Christ and the church” (NKJV).

<sup>30</sup> Revelation 21:9 – 10, “Come, I will show you the bride, the Lamb’s wife ... and showed me the great city, the holy Jerusalem, descending out of heaven from God” (NKJV).

<sup>31</sup> Revelation 21:24 – 27, “<sup>24</sup>And the nations of those who are saved shall walk in its light, and the kings of the earth bring their glory and honor into it. <sup>25</sup>Its gates shall not be shut at all by day (there shall be no night there). <sup>26</sup>And they shall bring the glory and the honor of the nations into it. <sup>27</sup>But there shall by no means enter it anything that defiles, or causes an abomination or a lie, but only those who are written in the Lamb’s Book of Life” (NKJV).

<sup>32</sup> 1 Corinthians 15:40 – 42, “<sup>40</sup>There are also celestial bodies and terrestrial bodies; but the glory of the celestial is one, and the glory of the terrestrial is another. <sup>41</sup>There is one glory of the sun, another glory of the moon, and another glory of the stars; for one star differs from another star in glory. <sup>42</sup>So also is the resurrection of the dead” (NKJV).

<sup>33</sup> Revelation 22:17, “And the Spirit and the bride say, “Come!” And let him who hears say, “Come!” And let him who thirsts come. Whoever desires, let him take the water of life freely” (NKJV).

suffered <sup>34</sup> and thereafter are changed into “no more flesh and blood/angelic/heavenly” at the end of that 1000 years.

So it can be inferred that Christians partake of the “Water of Life” during that 1000 years in sinless human resurrected body <sup>35</sup> and when “changed” into no more human or no more flesh and blood, they don’t need to take the “water of life” anymore. Notice that the source of the “water of life” is Christ <sup>36</sup> and He administers life in that way possibly because the “human” body can only receive it in that way but after the “change”, the Bride is “one flesh” with Him and so can partake life from Him directly meaning the Bride doesn’t need the “water of life” anymore. If this interpretation is true, then those saved as humans, i.e. *non-elect salvation* ones of the “nations of those saved” partake the “water of life” which flows into that final new earth where they dwell in their terrestrial (earthly) resurrection bodies.

The change from human to no more flesh and blood quotes for the Bride by *Chiliasm Church Fathers* <sup>37</sup> is fascinating and

---

<sup>34</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons, *Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 32, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103532.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103532.htm) and Tertullian, *Against Marcion*, Book III, Chapter 25, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/03123.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/03123.htm)

<sup>35</sup> Revelation 7:9 – 17, “I looked, and behold, a great multitude which no one could number, ... These are the ones who come out of the great tribulation ... 17for the Lamb who is in the midst of the throne will shepherd them and lead them to living fountains of waters” (NKJV).

<sup>36</sup> Revelation 22:1, “And he showed me a pure river of water of life, clear as crystal, proceeding from the throne of God and of the Lamb” (NKJV).

<sup>37</sup> St. Justin of Rome (Justin Martyr, c. 100AD - c. 160 AD) calls Christians as “gods rendering judgment to all men” (*Dialogue with Trypho*, Chapter 124), online source: [www.newadvent.org/fathers/01288.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/01288.htm). Note that this change from human to angelic is “gods” even in “theosis concept” in orthodox theology. St. Irenaeus of Lyons (c. 130 AD - c. 202 AD) writes, “because we have not been made gods from the beginning, but at first merely men, then at length gods” (*Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 38), online source: [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103438.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103438.htm). Tertullian (c. 155 AD – c. 240 AD) writes, “Of the heavenly kingdom this is the process. After its thousand years are over, within which period is completed the resurrection of the saints, who rise sooner or later according to their deserts there will ensue the destruction of the world and the conflagration of all things at the judgment: we shall then be changed in a moment into the substance of angels, even by the investiture of an incorruptible nature, and so be removed to that kingdom in heaven ... But the resurrection is one thing, and the kingdom is another. The resurrection is first, and afterwards the kingdom. We say, therefore, that the flesh rises again, but that when changed it obtains the kingdom. ... and we shall be changed, in a moment, in the twinkling of an eye ... in order, indeed, that it may be rendered a

stands in contrast to all prophecy interpretation found in modern Christianity be it protestants, catholic or orthodox. Could it be that this prophecy accuracy was lost and now found? In light of the evidence and the big Church Fathers' names that are quoted, personally, I think these has a high probability of being true. Nevertheless, since we cannot know prophecy until it comes to pass, this will remain a mystery.

Amazingly, even the non-Chiliasm Church Father St. Augustine of Hippo may have retained this same prophecy knowledge that

---

fit substance for the kingdom of God. "For we shall be like the angels." This will be the perfect change of our flesh—only after its resurrection. ... Having then become something else by its change, it will obtain the kingdom of God, no longer the (old) flesh and blood, but the body which God shall have given it. Rightly then does the apostle declare, "Flesh and blood cannot inherit the kingdom of God;" for this (honour) does he ascribe to the changed condition which ensues on the resurrection." ( *Against Marcion*, Book 3, Chapter 25), online source: [www.newadvent.org/fathers/03123.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/03123.htm) & ( *Against Marcion*, Book 5, Chapter 10), online source: [ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf03.v.iv.vi.x.html](http://ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf03.v.iv.vi.x.html) **St. Victorinus of Pettau** (c. 303 AD) writes, "At this same first resurrection ... dead in Christ will stand first, then we who are living, as we will be taken up with Him in the clouds to meet the Lord in the air; and thus we will always be with the Lord [1 Thessalonians 4:17]. A We have heard the trumpet spoken of; it is observed that in another place the Apostle names another trumpet. Therefore he says to the Corinthians: At the last trumpet, the dead will rise, will become immortal, and we will be changed. He says the dead will be raised immortal for bearing punishments, but it is shown that we are to be changed and to be covered in glory. [1 Corinthians 15:52] Therefore where we hear "the last trumpet," we must understand also a first, for these are two resurrections. Therefore, however many were not previously to rise in the first resurrection and to reign with Christ over the world [Revelation 20:4 - 6], over all nations, will rise at the last trumpet, after the thousand years, that is, in the last resurrection, among the impious and sinners and perpetrators of various kinds." ( *Commentary on the Apocalypse*), 18, online source: [earlychurchrevival.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/11/st-victorinus-of-poetovio-translated-by-kevin-edgecomb.pdf](http://earlychurchrevival.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/11/st-victorinus-of-poetovio-translated-by-kevin-edgecomb.pdf). **St. Methodius of Olympus** (died c. 311 AD) writes, "For I also, taking my journey, and going forth from the Egypt of this life, came first to the resurrection, which is the true Feast of the Tabernacles, and there having set up my tabernacle, adorned with the fruits of virtue, on the first day of the resurrection, which is the day of judgment, celebrate with Christ the millennium of rest, which is called the seventh day, even the true Sabbath. Then again from thence I, a follower of Jesus, who has entered into the heavens, Hebrews 4:14 as they also, after the rest of the Feast of Tabernacles, came into the laud of promise, come into the heavens, not continuing to remain in tabernacles — that is, my body not remaining as it was before, but, after the space of a thousand years, changed from a human and corruptible form into angelic size and beauty, where at last we virgins, when the festival of the resurrection is consummated, shall pass from the wonderful place of the tabernacle to greater and better things," ( *Banquet of the Ten Virgins*, Discourse 9, Chapter 5), online source: [www.newadvent.org/fathers/062309.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/062309.htm)

Christians eventually undergo this change from human to something angelic after their resurrection <sup>38</sup>.

## 2.4 Chiliasm Prophecy for the Timeline of Last Trumpet

For me, I think the earliest Church Fathers quoted have a higher chance of accuracy for this prophecy part since God Said prophecy is not of private interpretation.

Notice that the only Bible verse containing this exact phrase “last trumpet” is 1 Corinthians 15:52. Now, if you compare these “last trumpet” quotes, which according to St. Victorinus of Pettau happens at the “end of 1000 years Millennial Reign” (quoted earlier) where if combined with St. Irenaeus of Lyons’ quote where he seems to imply a second badge of righteous saved in “identical human bodies” (so earthly/terrestrial resurrection glory <sup>39</sup>) meaning *non-elect salvation* even toward his “enemies/opponents” context <sup>40</sup> which could possibly be the surprised sheep of the nations who seem to not know the Lord

---

<sup>38</sup> **St. Augustine of Hippo** (c. 354 AD – c. 430 AD) writes, “When they have been taken in who have been changed into angelic being, all entrance into the kingdom of heaven is closed; after the judgment, there is no more place for prayers or merit. [marg. note: 1 Cor 15:51]”. (*Catena Aurea*, Commentary on Matthew 25:1 – 13’s Parable of the Five Wise/Foolish Virgins), online source: [ccel.org/ccel/aquinas/catena1/catena1.ii.xxv.html](http://ccel.org/ccel/aquinas/catena1/catena1.ii.xxv.html)

<sup>39</sup> Body with “glory” must be saved and there seems to be two types, ‘earthly (terrestrial) vs heavenly (celestial)’ in the resurrection context. 1 Corinthians 15:40 reads, “There are also celestial bodies and terrestrial bodies; but the glory of the celestial is one, and the glory of the terrestrial is another” (NKJV).

<sup>40</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “1. Let our opponents — that is, they who speak against their own salvation— inform us [as to this point] ... This was symbolic of that man who had been bound in sins. And therefore the Lord said, Loose him, and let him depart. As, therefore, those who were healed were made whole in those members which had in times past been afflicted; and the dead rose in the identical bodies, their limbs and bodies receiving health, and that life which was granted by the Lord, who prefigures eternal things by temporal, and shows that it is He who is Himself able to extend both healing and life to His handiwork, that His words concerning its [future] resurrection may also be believed; so also at the end, when the Lord utters His voice by the last trumpet, 1 Corinthians 15:52 the dead shall be raised, as He Himself declares: The hour shall come, in which all the dead which are in the tombs shall hear the voice of the Son of man, and shall come forth; those that have done good to the resurrection **of life**, and those that have done evil to the resurrection of judgment. John 5:28” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 13), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103513.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103513.htm).

but the Lord knows them <sup>41</sup> based on their Charity Doctrine good acts toward “His Brethren” (Christians) <sup>42</sup>.

Please remember that under the *Chiliasm Prophecy Timeline* Christians are already saved for 1000 years participating in the first resurrection and now on Judgment Day, when the rest of the nations are judged, Christians are turned into no more flesh and blood being heavenly and so it seems hard to imagine these newly saved “surprised sheep” of the nations to be Christians because these are just saved now during this end of 1000 years!

This is why we encourage non-Christians to do Charity Doctrine acts toward Christians in hope that they may be saved by His Mercy.

We don't discourage them to believe because we also present the evidence of eternal hell if they do not repent on earth now showing honestly both possibilities as it exists in Christian thought.

We don't discourage them to believe because we also present the evidence of eternal hell if they do not repent on earth now showing honestly both possibilities as it exists in Christian thought.

I mean knowing both eternal hell and this *non-elect salvation* possibilities, each person has to make a decision to believe in Christ or not regardless.

---

<sup>41</sup> Matthew 25:37 – 40, “37“Then the righteous will answer Him, saying, ‘Lord, when did we see You hungry and feed You, or thirsty and give You drink? 38When did we see You a stranger and take You in, or naked and clothe You? 39Or when did we see You sick, or in prison, and come to You?’ 40And the King will answer and say to them, ‘Assuredly, I say to you, inasmuch as you did it to one of the least of these My brethren, you did it to Me.’” (NKJV).

<sup>42</sup> Matthew 12:50, “50For whoever does the will of My Father in heaven is My brother and sister and mother” (NKJV).

## 2.5 Evidence in the Book of 1 Enoch

In the book of 1 Enoch (considered canonical by some Christians such as the isolated Ethiopian Orthodox Church <sup>43</sup>), chapter 50 could be describing this “change” happening to the “elect” (Christians, Verse 1) from “human” to “no more flesh and blood/heavenly shining with “light of days”, “glory” and “honour” on “Judgment Day” when sinners are judged (Verse 2) which seems to be shown alongside *non-elect salvation* possibility toward “some” sinners who repent via “believing after seeing” (Verse 3) while those who do not repent “perish” thereafter eternally with no more hope in Hell (Verses 4 & 5) <sup>44</sup>.

## 2.6 Earliest Chiliasm Quotes

One of the earliest Chiliasm quote preserved outside the Bible is by St. Papias who was bishop of Hierapolis (c. 60 AD – c. 163 AD) and is described as "an ancient man who was a hearer

---

<sup>43</sup> Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahido Church Holy Synod. *A short history, faith and order of the Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahido Church*, Canonical Books, Addis Ababa 1983, [www.ethiopianorthodox.org/english/canonical/books.html](http://www.ethiopianorthodox.org/english/canonical/books.html)

<sup>44</sup> From-*The Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha of the Old Testament* R.H. Charles Oxford: The Clarendon *Book of 1 Enoch*, Chapter 50

“1 And in those days a change shall take place for the holy and elect,  
And the light of days shall abide upon them,

2 On the day of affliction on which evil shall have been treasured up against the sinners.

And the righteous shall be victorious in the name of the Lord of Spirits:

And He will cause the others to witness (this)

That they may repent

And forgo the works of their hands.

3 They shall have no honour through the name of the Lord of Spirits,

Yet through His name shall they be saved,

And the Lord of Spirits will have compassion on them,

For His compassion is great.

4 And He is righteous also in His judgement,

And in the presence of His glory unrighteousness also shall not maintain itself: At His judgment the u  
perish before Him.

5And from henceforth I will have no mercy on them, saith the Lord of Spirits.”

[www.ccel.org/c/charles/otpseudepig/enoch/ENOCH\\_2.HTM](http://www.ccel.org/c/charles/otpseudepig/enoch/ENOCH_2.HTM)

of John and a companion of Polycarp" by Polycarp's disciple St. Irenaeus of Lyons and later by Eusebius as well <sup>45</sup>.

It's highly unlikely that St. Papias who is so close to either the blessed Apostles or their direct disciples or both could err on such a prophecy. This prophecy states that all Christians (i.e. those of thirtyfold, sixtyfold and hundredfold reward levels of the parable of the Sower <sup>46</sup>) will be in the Wedding of the Lamb <sup>47</sup> and obtain a final abode in heaven. St. Papias describes the final heavens which contains the new heavenly Jerusalem <sup>48</sup> being divided into layers.

Before we see St. Papias's quote, let's discuss first what is written in the Bible regarding these layers of heaven. There is only one Verse in the Bible which describes the "third heaven" to contain "Paradise" <sup>49</sup>. No other verse describes the "layers" of heaven so the rest are just speculations. Among these speculations, a Jewish tradition matches what Apostle St. Paul wrote namely that the "third heaven" contains "Paradise" which reads, "lifted Adam up and gave him over to the archangel Michael, with the words, 'Raise him to the Paradise of the third heaven, and there thou shalt leave him until the great and fearful day ordained by Me'." <sup>50</sup> So if Apostle St. Paul was quoting this same tradition, then the "first and second heavens"

---

<sup>45</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons, *Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 33, (Schaff, NPNF-Vol 1, Christian Literature Publishing Co, 1885, USA), [www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf01.ix.vii.xxxiv.html](http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf01.ix.vii.xxxiv.html) and Eusebius (c. 260 AD – c. 339 AD), *Ecclesiastical History*, Book 3, Chapter 36, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/250103.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/250103.htm)

<sup>46</sup> Mark 4:20, "But these are the ones sown on good ground, those who hear the word, accept it, and bear fruit: some thirtyfold, some sixty, and some a hundred" (NKJV).

<sup>47</sup> Revelation 19:7 – 9.

<sup>48</sup> Revelation 21:1 – 3.

<sup>49</sup> 2 Corinthians 12:2 – 3, "God knows—such a one was caught up to the **third heaven**. 3And I know such a man—whether in the body or out of the body I do not know, God knows— 4how he was caught up into **Paradise** and heard inexpressible words, which it is not lawful for a man to utter" (NKJV).

<sup>50</sup> Louis Ginzberg, *Legends of the Jews*, Volume 1, The Death of Adam, The Jewish Publication Society, Philadelphia, 2003, 96, [bibleresourcespart2.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/legends-of-the-jews-complete-in-2-volumes.pdf](http://bibleresourcespart2.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/legends-of-the-jews-complete-in-2-volumes.pdf)

and not referring to anything earthly but the heavenly spiritual realm too as other traditional quotes here reveal, for example, “I entered the first heaven, and I saw a great sea hanging there, and farther on I saw a second heaven, brighter and more resplendent than the first. I said to the angel, ‘Why is this so?’ And the angel said to me, ‘Marvel not at this, for thou shalt see another heaven, brilliant beyond compare, and when thou hast ascended thither, thou shalt stand near the Lord, and thou shalt be His minister, and declare His mysteries to men” <sup>51</sup>.

Now, let’s look at St. Papias’ quote which describes the salvation in heaven as follows: “As the presbyters say, then those who are deemed worthy of an abode in heaven shall go there, others shall enjoy the delights of Paradise, and others shall possess the splendour of the city; for everywhere the Saviour will be seen, according as they shall be worthy who see Him. But that there is this distinction between the habitation of those who produce an hundredfold, and that of those who produce sixty-fold, and that of those who produce thirty-fold; for the first will be taken up into the heavens, the second class will dwell in Paradise, and the last will inhabit the city; and that on this account the Lord said, ‘In my Father’s house are many mansions’: John 14:2 for all things belong to God, who supplies all with a suitable dwelling-place, even as His word says, that a share is given to all by the Father, according as each one is or shall be worthy. And this is the couch in which they shall recline who feast, being invited to the wedding. The presbyters, the disciples of the apostles, say that this is the gradation and arrangement of those who are saved” <sup>52</sup>.

---

<sup>51</sup> Louis Ginzberg, *Legends of the Jews*, Volume 1, The Ascension of Levi, (The Jewish Publication Society, Philadelphia, 2003), 437.

<sup>52</sup> St. Papias, Bishop of Hierapolis, *Fragment V*, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0125.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0125.htm)



St. Irenaeus of Lyons believes in this same quote as well <sup>53</sup>. St. Papias describes that the lowest heaven is the new Jerusalem city which is the final abode of the thirtyfold reward level (a common gathering place for all the elect too <sup>54</sup>) which descends and connects to the final new earth <sup>55</sup>. Note that some Jewish tradition places the heavenly Jerusalem in the fourth or seventh heaven <sup>56</sup>. The general idea is that the “heavenly Jerusalem” and the “heavenly Temple” are situated in the same heaven usually <sup>57</sup>.

So this means that St. Papias’ quote implies that this heavenly Jerusalem then descends either from the fourth or seventh heaven to become the lowest heaven which connects to the final new earth. Next, we see that those who produce the higher sixtyfold fruit levels get a final abode in “Paradise” which we know could be the “Third Heaven” Apostle St. Paul talked about. Above that, we have those who produce the hundredfold fruit levels to have their final mansions in the heavens above all these. I think all Christians (thirtyfold, sixtyfold and hundredfold fruit levels) can freely visit any part of these heavens, but their “mansion” or final abode is different as St. Papias’ quote reveals here.

---

<sup>53</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons, *Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 36, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103536.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103536.htm).

<sup>54</sup> Hebrews 12:22 – 24.

<sup>55</sup> Revelation 21:9.

<sup>56</sup> Louis Ginzberg, *Legends of the Jews*, Volume 1, The First Day, (The Jewish Publication Society, Philadelphia, 2003), 9, reads, “As to the fourth heaven in which the heavenly temple is situated, comp. Zebahim 62a; Menahot 110a; Kebed Huppah, 11. For the literature appertaining to this subject, see Excursus I. PR 20, 98b, seems to locate the heavenly temple in the seventh heaven.” [bibleresourcespart2.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/legends-of-the-jews-complete-in-2-volumes.pdf](http://bibleresourcespart2.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/legends-of-the-jews-complete-in-2-volumes.pdf)

<sup>57</sup> Louis Ginzberg, *Legends of the Jews*, Volume 1, The Contest of the Mountains, (The Jewish Publication Society, Philadelphia, 2003), 595, reads, “Tehillim 68, 318; compare with p. 994. In the time to come God will cause the heavenly Jerusalem to descend upon these four mountains: Tabor, Hermon, Carmel and Sinai; see the quotation from an unknown Midrash (Yelam-medenu?) Makiri Is. 52, 195, and a similar statement in Yelammedenu in Yalkut II, 319, on Isa. 2 (here, probably owing to a printer’s error, Hermon is missing, and the heavenly Jerusalem is substituted, as is often the case, by the Temple; see p. 280, footnote 141), as well as Zerubbabel (ed. Wertheimer, 12a) according to which a fifth mountain, Lebanon, is to share this glory. Comp. also Tehillim, loc. Cit.”

The closest Bible verse which matches this description reads, “11Behold, I am coming quickly! Hold fast what you have, that no one may take your crown. 12He who overcomes, I will make him a pillar in the temple of My God, and he shall go out no more. I will write on him the name of My God and the name of the city of My God, the New Jerusalem, which comes down out of heaven from My God. And I will write on him My new name. 13“He who has an ear, let him hear what the Spirit says to the churches.” <sup>58</sup>.

Please observe the following when combined with St. Papias’ quote earlier:

i) This salvation in heaven is only for the elect/church/Christians (Verse 13).

ii) Each Christian dwells from the heavenly Jerusalem onward into the heavens and never goes out (Verse 12). This can imply *non-elect salvation* for those with final abode on the final new earth since Christians do not go out anymore (from the heavens) to have a final abode anywhere on earth as it is written here.

iii) Each Christian has a crown (verse 11) <sup>59</sup> and so a non-king or non-priest regular person saved on the final earth who could not enter through the gates into the new Jerusalem city could be *non-elect salvation* <sup>60</sup>. If everyone from that final earth could enter heaven, no need for a gate there, right?

---

<sup>58</sup> Revelation 3:11 – 13 (NKJV).

<sup>59</sup> Revelation 1:6 reads, “and has made us kings and priests to His God and Father,” (NKJV).

<sup>60</sup> Revelation 21:24, 27, reads, “24And the **nations of those who are saved** shall walk in its light, and the **kings** of the earth bring their glory and honor into it. 27But there shall by no means enter it anything that defiles, or causes an abomination or a lie, but only those who are written in the **Lamb’s Book of Life**” (NKJV).

Also this is after the Book of Life results are revealed <sup>61</sup> and in final new earth and heavens <sup>62</sup> meaning it's not the Millennial Reign on old earth and old heavens <sup>63</sup>.

iv) Chiliasm Church Fathers clearly describe 1000 years in a perfect human body resurrection for Christians in old earth and heavens before the change into no more flesh and blood at this time as discussed in earlier sections. This means that Christians are having a heavenly body now (celestial) and so can enter heaven but some of those saved on earth have only an earthly body glory (terrestrial) <sup>64</sup> and so cannot enter these final heavens with it meaning no one can trick or bypass the gate secretly since even physically it's impossible.

v) In light of this *Chiliasm* prophecy possibility, together with Tertullian, St. Victorinus, and St. Irenaeus of Lyons' "last trumpet" quote in earlier section, we see that while Christians are changed from no more flesh and blood into angelic at the end of this 1000 years, a simultaneous second badge of righteous are just raised and are being saved hence *non-elect salvation* (if this interpretation is true). Those of first resurrection (elect) rise at the start of the 1000 years <sup>65</sup> while those of the second resurrection (non-elect) rise at the end of this 1000 years <sup>66</sup>.

---

<sup>61</sup> Revelation 20:11 – 15.

<sup>62</sup> Revelation 21:1 – 3.

<sup>63</sup> Revelation 20:4 – 6.

<sup>64</sup> 1 Corinthians 15:40 reads, "*There are also celestial bodies and terrestrial bodies; but the glory of the celestial is one, and the glory of the terrestrial is another*" (NKJV).

<sup>65</sup> Revelation 20:4 – 6, "And they lived and reigned with Christ for a thousand years. 5But the rest of the dead did not live again until the thousand years were finished. This is the first resurrection. 6Blessed and holy is he who has part in the first resurrection. Over such the second death has no power, but they shall be priests of God and of Christ and shall reign with Him a thousand years" (NKJV).

<sup>66</sup> Revelation 20:5, "5But the rest of the dead did not live again until the thousand years were finished" (NKJV).

vi) This matches a literal reading of both Lord Jesus Christ's Prophecy <sup>67</sup> for the time at the end and Prophet Daniel's vision <sup>68</sup> where in those saved during the second resurrection (hence non-elect salvation) rise simultaneously with the wicked who are judged and/or condemned.

vii) Firstly, we know that there are two resurrections within His Millennial Reign. If each phrase is to have its own meaning, then in John 5 for those who are saved, Christ used two different parabolic phrases pertaining to the "last day" <sup>69</sup> which refers to this 1000 years (Millennial) reign <sup>70</sup> namely the "hour now is" which could refer to the "start" (hence "first resurrection" timeline) on this "last day" followed by the phrase "the hour is coming" referring to the "end" (hence "second resurrection" timeline) on this 'same last day'.

viii) Notice that Christ may have Spoken two resurrections to life using these same phrases as follows: "Most assuredly, I say to you, the hour is coming, and now is, when the dead will hear the voice of the Son of God; and those who hear will live." <sup>71</sup> Observe that for those who will obtain a resurrection unto life during the "hour is coming" refers to the second resurrection's *non-elect salvation* while those who will be raised to eternal life during the "hour now is" refers to the "first resurrection" (if this interpretation is true).

---

<sup>67</sup> John 5:28 – 29 reads, "28Do not marvel at this; for the hour is coming in which all who are in the graves will hear His voice 29and come forth—those who have done good, to the resurrection of life, and those who have done evil, to the resurrection of condemnation" (NKJV).

<sup>68</sup> Daniel 12:2 – 3 reads, "2And many of those who sleep in the dust of the earth shall awake,  
Some to everlasting life, Some to shame and everlasting contempt" (NKJV).

<sup>69</sup> John 6:40 reads, "And this is the will of Him who sent Me, that everyone who sees the Son and believes in Him may have everlasting life; and I will raise him up at the last day" (NKJV).

<sup>70</sup> Hebrews 4:6, 8 – 9 reads, "6Since therefore it remains that some must enter it, and those to whom it was first preached did not enter because of disobedience. 8For if Joshua had given them rest, then He would not afterward have spoken of another day. 9There remains therefore a rest for the people of God" (NKJV).

<sup>71</sup> John 5:25 (NKJV)

ix) Such a fine detail could be true since St. Irenaeus of Lyons' quote for possible *non-elect salvation* during the second resurrection timeline also quotes that the wicked are raised "simultaneously" with a badge of "righteous" literally and during the "last trumpet" (end of 1000 years in *Chiliasm* timeline) and the "hour shall come" or "hour is coming" phrase from John 5 earlier is used without the phrase "hour now is" proving possible distinction as follows, "that His words concerning its [future] resurrection may also be believed; so also at the end, when the Lord utters His voice by the last trumpet, 1 Corinthians 15:52 the dead shall be raised, as He Himself declares: The hour shall come, in which all the dead which are in the tombs shall hear the voice of the Son of man, and shall come forth; those that have done good to the resurrection of life, and those that have done evil to the resurrection of judgment. John 5:28" <sup>72</sup>.

x) Returning to prophet Daniel's vision, we see that Christians who are already raised 1000 years earlier during the first resurrection by this time undergo that "change" from "human" to "no more flesh and blood" to obtain that celestial or heavenly body (parabolically, the shine as "heavens/firmament" or stars" part here) during this second resurrection timeline (as per *Chiliasm Church Father* quotes in earlier sections) which is described as follows: "Those who are wise shall shine like the brightness of the firmament, and those who turn many to righteousness like the stars forever and ever" <sup>73</sup>. This also means that any resurrection verse in the Bible must first be questioned as to whether they are describing the first or second resurrection timeline which spans 1000 years.

---

<sup>72</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons, *Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 13, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103513.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103513.htm)

<sup>73</sup> Daniel 12:3 (NKJV).

xi) Even St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes that every Christian is a heavenly priest <sup>74</sup> and so a non-priest among those saved nations on that final earth could be *non-elect salvation*.

xii) As a sample, I will show another quote from St. Gregory Nazianzus which shows that he seems to view some “saved by fire” (*non-elect salvation*) while “others perish in that same unquenchable fire” (the damned) which reads as follows, “For I know a cleansing fire which Christ came to send upon the earth, and He Himself is analogically called a Fire. ... I know also a fire which is not cleansing, but avenging; either that fire of Sodom which He pours down on all sinners, mingled with brimstone and storms, or that which is prepared for the Devil and his Angels or that which proceeds from the face of the Lord, and shall burn up his enemies round about; and one even more fearful still than these, the unquenchable fire which is ranged with the worm that dieth not but is eternal for the wicked. For all these belong to the destroying power; though some may prefer even in this place to take a more merciful view of this fire, worthily of Him That chastises” <sup>75</sup>.

xiii) St. Gregory Nazianzus also has this strange quote where he writes, “I know of three classes among the saved; the slaves, the hired servants, the sons” <sup>76</sup> meaning since all those of elect salvation are “sons of God” <sup>77</sup> and all Christians are saved in the marriage of the Lamb during the first resurrection in *Chiliasm* timeline <sup>78</sup>, the hired servants could be Israel’s *non-elect salvation* <sup>79</sup> while the slaves could be the gentiles’ *non-elect*

---

<sup>74</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “Now, in the preceding book I have shown that all the disciples of the Lord are Levites and priests, they who used in the temple to profane the Sabbath, but are blameless.” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 34), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103534.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103534.htm)

<sup>75</sup> St. Gregory Nazianzus (c. 329 AD – 390 AD), *Oration 40*, Chapter 36, [www.ewtn.com/catholicism/library/select-orations-334-3741-11647](http://www.ewtn.com/catholicism/library/select-orations-334-3741-11647)

<sup>76</sup> St. Gregory Nazianzus, *Oration 40*, Chapter 13, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/310240.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/310240.htm)

<sup>77</sup> Galatians 3:26 reads, “For you are all sons of God through faith in Christ Jesus” (NKJV).

<sup>78</sup> Matthew 25:1 – 13.

<sup>79</sup> Matthew 25:14 – 30.

*salvation* as the ‘surprised sheep’ of the nations<sup>80</sup> taking Matthew 25 to be viewed as a judgment summary for this entire 1000 years (Millennial) Reign of Christ.

## **2.7 Does error in eschatology make one a heretic?**

St. Justin of Rome (St. Justin Martyr, c.100 AD – c. 160 AD) while writing that Chiliasm prophecy is true <sup>81</sup> but acknowledged that some who err in eschatology are still pious and godly Christians while others are downright heretics <sup>82</sup>. It is to be noted that in earlier sections I am giving an interpretation of these Chiliasm quotes which are available to support *non-elect salvation* possibility which is not final as this is open to debate and would be more meaningful if other scholars can take these same quotes by these same Chiliasm church fathers and prove the eschatology which they believe in. If other scholars or denominations of Christianity (even within Protestantism) cannot prove their eschatology by using these same quotes, doesn't it sound dangerous especially in light of the verse which reads that “no prophecy of Scripture is of any private interpretation”? <sup>83</sup>

---

<sup>80</sup> Matthew 25:31 – 46.

<sup>81</sup> St. Justin of Rome writes, “But I and others, who are right-minded Christians on all points, are assured that there will be a resurrection of the dead, and a thousand years in Jerusalem, which will then be built, adorned, and enlarged, [as] the prophets Ezekiel and Isaiah and others declare. ... And further, there was a certain man with us, whose name was John, one of the apostles of Christ, who prophesied, by a revelation that was made to him, that those who believed in our Christ would dwell a thousand years in Jerusalem; and that thereafter the general, and, in short, the eternal resurrection and judgment of all men would likewise take place. Just as our Lord also said, ‘They shall neither marry nor be given in marriage, but shall be equal to the angels, the children of the God of the resurrection.’ Luke 20:35” (*Dialogue with Trypho*, Chapters 80 – 81), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm)

<sup>82</sup> St. Justin of Rome writes, “I admitted to you formerly, that I and many others are of this opinion, and [believe] that such will take place, as you assuredly are aware; but, on the other hand, I signified to you that many who belong to the pure and pious faith, and are true Christians, think otherwise. Moreover, I pointed out to you that some who are called Christians, but are godless, impious heretics, teach doctrines that are in every way blasphemous, atheistical, and foolish.” (*Dialogue with Trypho*, Chapter 80), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm)

<sup>83</sup> 2 Peter 1:20 (NKJV).

If God has stated in New Testament scripture that prophecy is not of private interpretation, then wouldn't God in His Omnipotence have preserved some parts of right interpretation in the writings of these earliest church fathers? Whether I am quoting and reading these Chiliasm church fathers rightly or not is open to debate, but the burden of proof does not just fall upon me but upon every denomination of Christianity likewise to use these same quotes and prove their eschatology with it.

Where these church fathers have differed, it proves that someone is wrong, and this is why I treat them as *possibilities*. This is the most honest way of research with evidence I see with eschatological prophecy. God will understand if we present possibilities based on evidence in Chiliasm church fathers' writings like this because that's what is available to us. I choose the Chiliasm church fathers especially since they are the *earliest* surviving writing in entire Christian history timeline whose prophecy and eschatological aspect have survived and where they differ, I usually take the earlier quotes in time and mostly see St. Justin of Rome (St. Justin Martyr) and St. Irenaeus of Lyons as most accurate.

The popular objection by some protestant scholars that these quotes have been tampered with by Roman Catholics and/or Orthodox is unproven too. The fact that the Catholic church is actually non-Chiliasm due to St. Augustine of Hippo who was influenced by Origen of Alexandria <sup>84</sup> (the earliest big name they can quote) but yet the Catholic church preserved all these Chiliasm church father quotes as it seems to point that these quotes could be authentic. Taking the case of the Jews of the past, God used the same unbelieving Jews to preserve Old Testament scripture and so it's no surprise if He can do the

---

<sup>84</sup> Catholic Encyclopaedia, *Millennium and Millenarianism*, an article which explains the fundamental idea of millenarianism, as understood by Christian writers, published between 1907 and 1912, [www.catholic.com/encyclopedia/millennium-and-millenarianism](http://www.catholic.com/encyclopedia/millennium-and-millenarianism)



same with Chiasm quotes with Catholics from a protestant point of view likewise, right?

## 2.8 St. Augustine of Hippo and his view on Eschatological Heresy

St. Augustine of Hippo (354 AD – 430 AD) is a giant of faith not just for Roman Catholics but also the Orthodox and Protestants too. However, not many know that the one who converted St. Augustine of Hippo and even baptized him around 386 AD is none other than St. Ambrose of Milan <sup>85</sup>. It is interesting that St. Ambrose of Milan (c. 340 AD – c. 397 AD) has some *non-elect salvation* quotes such as this, “For now, since all do not believe, all do not seem to be in subjection. But when all have believed and done the will of God, then Christ will be all and in all. And when Christ is all and in all, then will God be all and in all” <sup>86</sup> which has affected Roman Catholicism to the point that the new, post-Vatican II Catechism says: "In hope, the Church prays for 'all men to be saved'." <sup>87</sup>

St. Augustine of Hippo does not view even Christian Universalists who do not believe in eternal hell but some type of purgatorial hell which lasts only to the ages as heretics. Bear in mind that church fathers are well known to brand any heretic at sight. In fact, St. Augustine also included a *possibility* that some type of *salvation outside the kingdom of God* (i.e. a type of *non-elect salvation* on the final new earth? I add) may still be *conceivable in the slightest degree* <sup>88</sup>.

---

<sup>85</sup> TeSelle, Eugene. *Augustine the Theologian*. Wipf and Stock (USA, ISBN 978-1-57910-918-9, 2002), 343.

<sup>86</sup> St. Ambrose of Milan, *Exposition of the Christian Faith*, Book 5, Chapter 15, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/34045.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/34045.htm)

<sup>87</sup> Catechism of the Catholic Church, *CCC 1821*, [http://www.catholic-catechism.com/ccc\\_1.74.618.851.956.1256.1261.1349.1821.1900.2240.2574.2634.2822.htm](http://www.catholic-catechism.com/ccc_1.74.618.851.956.1256.1261.1349.1821.1900.2240.2574.2634.2822.htm)

<sup>88</sup> St. Augustine of Hippo writes, “112. It is quite in vain, then, that some--indeed very many--yield to merely human feelings and deplore the notion of the eternal punishment of the damned and their interminable and perpetual misery. They do not believe that such things will be. Not that they would go counter to divine Scripture--but, yielding to their own human feelings ... Now, if this wrath were all

This means that we too can emulate his faith likewise <sup>89</sup> in viewing *non-elect salvation* as a *possibility* even “may wish to think about gradations of punishment, or the relief or intermission of their misery” as St. Augustine wrote to allow even the thought of “*relief of their misery*” here and not be condemned to any eternal hell if wrong since I don’t think any protestant scholar would say that St. Augustine his converter St. Ambrose is unsaved, right?

## 2.9 Possible Scripture Level Vision – Shepherd of Hermas

Firstly, the Shepherd of Hermas (*The Pastor*) writing has been called as “Scripture” by some early church fathers including *Chiliasm* church fathers such as St. Irenaeus of Lyons and even Tertullian and was also in the “first known Bibles” of Christianity such as the Roman Canon/Muratorian Canon in the West and Codex Sinaiticus <sup>90</sup> (4th century) in the East.

Tertullian as a Montanist <sup>91</sup> wrote, “But I would yield my ground to you, if the scripture of the Shepherd, which is the only one which favours adulterers, had deserved to find a place in the Divine canon; if it had not been habitually judged by every

---

there is in man's damnation, and even if it were present only in the slightest degree conceivable--still, to be lost out of the Kingdom of God, to be an exile from the City of God, to be estranged from the life of God, to suffer loss of the great abundance of God's blessings which he has hidden for those who fear him and prepared for those who hope in him<sup>240</sup> --this would be a punishment so great that, if it be eternal, no torments that we know could be compared to it, no matter how many ages they continued. 113. The eternal death of the damned--that is, their estrangement from the life of God--will therefore abide without end, and it will be common to them all, no matter what some people, moved by their human feelings, may wish to think about gradations of punishment, or the relief or intermission of their misery. In the same way, the eternal life of the saints will abide forever, and also be common to all of them no matter how different the grades of rank and honor in which they shine forth in their effulgent harmony.” (*Enchiridion*, "The Last Things", Chapter 29), [www.tertullian.org/fathers/augustine\\_enchiridion\\_02\\_trans.htm](http://www.tertullian.org/fathers/augustine_enchiridion_02_trans.htm)

<sup>89</sup> Hebrews 13:7, “Remember those who rule over you, who have spoken the word of God to you, whose faith follow, considering the outcome of *their* conduct” (NKJV).

<sup>90</sup> *Codex Sinaiticus*, [codexsinaiticus.org/en/codex/content.aspx](http://codexsinaiticus.org/en/codex/content.aspx)

<sup>91</sup> A *Catholic encyclopedia* writes, “St. Irenaeus and Tertullian (in his Catholic days) cite the “Shepherd” as Scripture. Tertullian, when a Montanist, implies that Pope St. Callistus had quoted it as an authority (though evidently not as Scripture),” in his reply here. [www.catholic.com/encyclopedia/hermas](http://www.catholic.com/encyclopedia/hermas)

council of Churches (even of your own) among apocryphal and false (writings); ... I, however, imbibe the Scriptures of that Shepherd who cannot be broken.”<sup>92</sup>

A greater witness is St. Irenaeus of Lyons who called the Shepherd of Hermas as Scripture when he quoted it as follows: “2. Truly, then, the Scripture declared, which says, First of all believe that there is one God, who has established all things, and completed them, and having caused that from what had no being, all things should come into existence: He who contains all things, and is Himself contained by no one.”<sup>93</sup> Compare this against the preserved Shepherd of Hermas quote to see the match<sup>94</sup>.

The Roman Canon (“Muratorian Canon” c. 170 AD) which is the oldest known canonical list of New Testament Scripture whose surviving fragment lists the Shepherd of Hermas as Scripture and says, “But Hermas wrote The Shepherd very recently, in our times, in the city of Rome, while bishop Pius, his brother, was occupying the chair of the church of the city of Rome. And therefore, it ought indeed to be read; but it cannot be read publicly to the people in church either among the Prophets, whose number is complete, or among the Apostles, for it is after their time.”<sup>95</sup>

St. Athanasius the Great did not classify Shepherd of Hermas as Scripture in his famous letter which lists all 27 New Testament books but yet he approved it for usage. Few have noticed that in this same letter, St. Athanasius places the

---

<sup>92</sup> Tertullian (c. 155 AD – c. 240 AD), *On Modesty* (“De pudicitia”), Chapter 10, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0407.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0407.htm)

<sup>93</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons, *Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 20, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103420.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103420.htm)

<sup>94</sup> *Shepherd of Hermas*, Book 2, Commandment 1, reads, “First of all, believe that there is one God who created and finished all things, and made all things out of nothing. He alone is able to contain the whole, but Himself cannot be contained”, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/02012.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/02012.htm)

<sup>95</sup> G. M. Hahneman. *The Muratorian Fragment and the Origins of the New Testament Canon in "The Canon Debate"* (ed. L. M. McDonald and J. A. Sanders, Massachusetts: Hendrickson, 2002), 405–415.

“Shepherd of Hermas” (called the *Shepherd* or *Pastor*) in the same level as “Esther” where today, “Esther” is considered one of the 66 books in the protestant Bible. This means “Shepherd of Hermas” too has such a potential though we cannot say for sure hence it remains a possibility only <sup>96</sup>. Interestingly, the Shepherd of Hermas has never been condemned by any church council and earliest Bible canons listed it as Scripture. It just went out of use and so it remains a mystery as such.

The Shepherd of Hermas calls the elect salvation as the salvation in the “Tower [of Repentance]” parabolically as representing the “Church” <sup>97</sup>. This same “Elect Tower” concept is quoted by *Chiliasm* church father St. Irenaeus of Lyons too <sup>98</sup>. However, during this same vision, the Shepherd of Hermas reveals further that there is a *non-elect salvation* possibility <sup>99</sup>

---

<sup>96</sup> After listing the 27 New Testament books, St. Athanasius the Great writes, “These are the springs of salvation, in order that he who is thirsty may fully refresh himself with the words contained in them. In them alone is the doctrine of piety proclaimed. Let no one add anything to them or take anything away from them ... But for the sake of greater accuracy I add, being constrained to write, that there are also other books besides these, which have not indeed been put in the canon, but have been appointed by the Fathers as reading-matter for those who have just come forward and which to be instructed in the doctrine of piety: the Wisdom of Solomon, the Wisdom of Sirach, Esther, Judith, Tobias, the so-called Teaching [Didache] of the Apostles, and the Shepherd. And although, beloved, the former are in the canon and the latter serve as reading matter,” (*39th Festal Letter*, c. 367 AD), <http://www.ntcanon.org/Athanasius.shtml>

<sup>97</sup> Shepherd of Hermas reads, “Many indeed shall hear, and hearing, some shall be glad, and some shall weep. But even these, if they hear and repent, shall also rejoice. Hear, then, the parables of the tower; ... The tower which you see building is myself, the Church, who have appeared to you now and on the former occasion. Ask, then, whatever you like in regard to the tower, and I will reveal it to you, that you may rejoice with the saints.” (Book 1, Vision 3, Chapter 3); [www.newadvent.org/fathers/02011.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/02011.htm)

<sup>98</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “the beautiful elect tower being also raised everywhere. For the illustrious Church is [now] everywhere, and everywhere is the winepress dug: because those who do receive the Spirit are everywhere.” (Against Heresies, Book 4, Chapter 36), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103436.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103436.htm)

<sup>99</sup> Shepherd of Hermas reads, “Do you wish to know who are the others which fell near the waters, but could not be rolled into them? These are they who have heard the word and wish to be baptized in the name of the Lord; but when the chastity demanded by the truth comes into their recollection, they draw back, and again walk after their own wicked desires. She finished her exposition of the tower. But I, shameless as I yet was, asked her, Is repentance possible for all those stones which have been cast away and did not fit into the building of the tower, and will they yet have a place in this tower? Repentance, said she, is yet possible, but in this tower, they cannot find a suitable place. But in another and much inferior place they will be laid, and that, too, only when they have been

outside the “Elect Tower” for “all the rejected stones” where “stones” refer to “people” parabolically throughout these visions including those who have “heard the Gospel and wished to be baptized” but remain “unbaptized” and regressed into their “wicked sins”.

It is to be noted that this *non-elect salvation* in another much more inferior place is only attainable if they repent in fire of punishment first and have partaken of the righteous word (possibly Christ’s Commands during some period of their lives which I personally think is the holiness and charity doctrine commands).

We can match the “elect tower salvation” as referring to the “final new heavens” abode while the *non-elect salvation* outside the tower salvation to the “final new earth” abode in our previous discussions. Also, notice that if the Roman Catholic doctrine of purgatory is true, then these must be placed back “into the tower” after purgatory as that’s how they teach it but it is not the case here as the salvation is not in the tower (church) after this anymore implying *non-elect salvation* possibility only. Notice that these are not said to repent on earth “despite having heard of the Gospel since they walk back according to their evil desires” meaning that this is not the unlearnt case or equivalent either.

## **2.10 Rabbinical Judaism and its Two Types of Proselytes**

In rabbinical Judaism, there are two types of proselytes namely the “full proselyte” (*ger Tzedek*, devout proselyte) and “half proselyte” (*ger toshav*, limited proselyte) where the former is bound to keep all the Torah while the latter is only required to keep the seven laws of Noah to be assured a place in the world

---

tortured and completed the days of their sins. And on this account will they be transferred, because they have partaken of the righteous Word. And then only will they be removed from their punishments when the thought of repenting of the evil deeds which they have done has come into their hearts. But if it does not come into their hearts, they will not be saved on account of the hardness of their heart.” (Book 1, Vision 3, Chapter 7); [www.newadvent.org/fathers/02011.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/02011.htm)

to come (i.e. do not worship idols, do not blaspheme God's name, do not murder, do not commit fornication (immoral sexual acts), do not steal, do not tear the limb from a living animal, and do not fail to establish rule of law where this is traditionally enumerated in the Babylonian Talmud Sanhedrin 56a-b and Tosefta Avodah Zarah 9:4 <sup>100</sup>).

One of the interesting debates in regard to who can be considered a “half proselyte” or not is in the topic of “idolatry” and how far there is a leeway <sup>101</sup>. Perhaps the Parable of the Good Samaritan <sup>102</sup> by Christ can refer to such *non-elect salvation* hope since Christ Himself Said that Samaritans “do not know God” <sup>103</sup> opening hope for such Samaritans who did Charity Doctrine toward their “enemies-Jews level” which can be analogous to a non-Christian doing Charity Doctrine to a Christian, right?

Perhaps these are the surprised sheep of the nations who seem to *not know Christ* as they ask back, “When did we see You Lord

---

<sup>100</sup> Berlin, Meyer; Zevin, Shlomo Yosef. "BEN NOAH". *Encyclopedia Talmudica: A Digest of Halachic Literature and Jewish Law from the Tannaitic Period to the Present Time, Alphabetically Arranged*. Vol. IV. Jerusalem: Yad Harav Herzog (Emet, ISBN 0873067142, eds. (1992) [1969]). 360–380.

<sup>101</sup> For a discussion of whether the rabbinic conception of the Noahide prohibition of idolatry mirrors the Torah's prohibition of idolatry or has more leeway, see Klein, Reuven Chaim. "*World Religions and the Noahide Prohibition of Idolatry*" (PDF, 2022). *Journal of Halacha and Contemporary Society*. 79: 109–167, [hcommons.org/deposits/download/hc:50798/CONTENT/shituf-article.pdf](https://commons.org/deposits/download/hc:50798/CONTENT/shituf-article.pdf)

<sup>102</sup> Luke 10:25, 27, 30, 33 – 37 reads, “25And behold, a certain lawyer stood up and tested Him, saying, “Teacher, what shall I do to inherit eternal life?” 27So he answered and said, “ ‘You shall love the Lord your God with all your heart, with all your soul, with all your strength, and with all your mind,’ and ‘your neighbor as yourself.’ ” 30Then Jesus answered and said: “A certain man went down from Jerusalem to Jericho, and fell among thieves, who stripped him of his clothing, wounded him, and departed, leaving him half dead. 33But a certain Samaritan, as he journeyed, came where he was. And when he saw him, he had compassion. 34So he went to him and bandaged his wounds, pouring on oil and wine; and he set him on his own animal, brought him to an inn, and took care of him. 35On the next day, when he departed, he took out two denarii, gave them to the innkeeper, and said to him, ‘Take care of him; and whatever more you spend, when I come again, I will repay you.’ 36So which of these three do you think was neighbor to him who fell among the thieves? 37And he said, “He who showed mercy on him.”

Then Jesus said to him, ‘Go and do likewise.’ ” (NKJV).

<sup>103</sup> John 4:22 reads, “22You worship what you do not know; we know what we worship, for salvation is of the Jews” (NKJV).

being hungry, thirsty, stranger, naked, sick and in prison?” but *Christ knows them* based on their Charity Doctrine deeds done toward “His Brethren” or Christians <sup>104</sup> and being righteous? <sup>105</sup>

Note that in *Chiliasm* prophecy timeline, this happens at the “Last Trumpet” at the “end” of 1000 years meaning Christians are already saved 1000 years earlier and at this time they “change” from human to no more flesh and blood or angelic, so wouldn’t be just saved at this time nor surprised, right?

Indeed, even St. Irenaeus of Lyons points to elect salvation to happen at the start of 1000 years when Christ Returns (2<sup>nd</sup> Coming) <sup>106</sup> which he calls as the “*times of the kingdom*” <sup>107</sup> in his writing <sup>108</sup> while also points to a literal second badge of

---

<sup>104</sup> Matthew 12:50.

<sup>105</sup> Matthew 25:31 – 46.

<sup>106</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “But when this Antichrist shall have devastated all things in this world, he will reign for three years and six months, and sit in the temple at Jerusalem; and then the Lord will come from heaven in the clouds, in the glory of the Father, sending this man and those who follow him into the lake of fire; but bringing in for the righteous the times of the kingdom, that is, the rest, the hallowed seventh day; and restoring to Abraham the promised inheritance, in which kingdom the Lord declared, that many coming from the east and from the west should sit down with Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob. Matthew 8:11” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 30), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103530.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103530.htm)

<sup>107</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “For in the times of the kingdom, the righteous man who is upon the earth shall then forget to die. ... 3. John, therefore, did distinctly foresee the first resurrection of the just, Luke 14:14 and the inheritance in the kingdom of the earth; and what the prophets have prophesied concerning it harmonize [with his vision]. For the Lord also taught these things, when He promised that He would have the mixed cup new with His disciples in the kingdom. The apostle, too, has confessed that the creation shall be free from the bondage of corruption, [so as to pass] into the liberty of the sons of God. Romans 8:21 And in all these things, and by them all, the same God the Father is manifested, who fashioned man, and gave promise of the inheritance of the earth to the fathers, who brought it (the creature) forth [from bondage] at the resurrection of the just, and fulfils the promises for the kingdom of His Son; subsequently bestowing in a paternal manner those things which neither the eye has seen, nor the ear has heard, nor has [thought concerning them] arisen within the heart of man, 1 Corinthians 2:9; Isaiah 64:4 (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 36), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103536.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103536.htm)

<sup>108</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “For what are the hundred-fold [rewards] in this word, the entertainments given to the poor, and the suppers for which a return is made? These are [to take place] in the times of the kingdom, that is, upon the seventh day, ... The predicted blessing, therefore, belongs unquestionably to the times of the kingdom, when the righteous shall bear rule upon their rising from the dead; when also the creation, having been renovated and set free, shall fructify with an abundance of all kinds of food, from the dew of heaven, and from

righteous to be saved only on Judgment Day at the end of this 1000 years which period he calls as “*after the times of the kingdom*” and refers to this also as the “*General Resurrection*”<sup>109</sup> in his writing who rise simultaneously with the wicked to be judged quoting Matthew 25:31 – 46’s context to refer to this timeline too which involves the “whole human race” <sup>110</sup>.

Recall that St. Irenaeus of Lyons quoted the “last trumpet” context <sup>111</sup> to refer to this end of 1000 years “*after the times of the kingdom*” for the “*general resurrection*” because he clearly only views the wicked to rise simultaneously for judgment with hope for some of *his opponents* too *who did good* to get *non-elect*

---

the fertility of the earth: as the elders who saw John, the disciple of the Lord, related that they had heard from him how the Lord used to teach in regard to these times” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 33), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103533.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103533.htm)

<sup>109</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “But in the times of the kingdom, the earth has been called again by Christ [to its pristine condition], and Jerusalem rebuilt after the pattern of the Jerusalem above, of which the prophet Isaiah says ... but of the Jerusalem which has been delineated on [God's] hands. And in the Apocalypse John saw this new [Jerusalem] descending upon the new earth. Revelation 21:2 For after the times of the kingdom, he says, I saw a great white throne, and Him who sat upon it, from whose face the earth fled away, and the heavens; and there was no more place for them. Revelation 20:11 And he sets forth, too, the things connected with the general resurrection and the judgment, mentioning the dead, great and small. The sea, he says, gave up the dead which it had in it, and death and hell delivered up the dead that they contained; and the books were opened. Moreover, he says, the book of life was opened, and the dead were judged out of those things that were written in the books, according to their works; and death and hell were sent into the lake of fire, the second death. Revelation 20:12-14 Now this is what is called Gehenna, which the Lord styled eternal fire. Matthew 25:41 And if any one, it is said, was not found written in the book of life, he was sent into the lake of fire. Revelation 20:15 And after this, he says, I saw a new heaven and a new earth, for the first heaven and earth have passed away; also there was no more sea. And I saw the holy city, new Jerusalem, coming down from heaven, as a bride adorned for her husband.” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 35), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103535.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103535.htm)

<sup>110</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “But inasmuch as one and the same Lord has pointed out that the whole human race shall be divided at the judgment, as a shepherd divides the sheep from the goats, Matthew 25:32 and that to some He will say, Come, you blessed of My Father, receive the kingdom which has been prepared for you, Matthew 25:34 but to others, Depart from me, you cursed, into everlasting fire, which My Father has prepared for the devil and his angels, Matthew 25:41” (*Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 40), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103440.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103440.htm)

<sup>111</sup> 1 Corinthians 15:52’s “at the last trumpet ... the dead will be raised incorruptible” (NKJV).



*salvation* during this time, right? <sup>112</sup> Interestingly, St. Justin of Rome (St. Justin Martyr) is attested to have written that the “flesh indeed dies” in the context of “kingdom of heaven” which can mean he is referring to the “change” from “human” to “no more flesh and blood” for those who will “inherit heaven” <sup>113</sup> and since this was quoted by St. Methodius of Olympus who described this part vividly elsewhere <sup>114</sup>, it raises the question whether this quote was a rephrase from one of St. Justin’s lost writings.

---

<sup>112</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “1. Let our opponents — that is, they who speak against their own salvation— inform us [as to this point] ... This was symbolic of that man who had been bound in sins. And therefore, the Lord said, Loose him, and let him depart. As, therefore, those who were healed were made whole in those members which had in times past been afflicted; and the dead rose in the identical bodies, their limbs and bodies receiving health, and that life which was granted by the Lord, who prefigures eternal things by temporal, and shows that it is He who is Himself able to extend both healing and life to His handiwork, that His words concerning its [future] resurrection may also be believed; so also at the end, when the Lord utters His voice by the last trumpet, 1 Corinthians 15:52 the dead shall be raised, as He Himself declares: The hour shall come, in which all the dead which are in the tombs shall hear the voice of the Son of man, and shall come forth; those that have done good to the resurrection of life, and those that have done evil to the resurrection of judgment. John 5:28” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 13), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103513.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103513.htm). Note: I wish we had a verse by verse commentary of the Book of Revelation by St. Justin or St. Irenaeus but we don’t.

<sup>113</sup> St. Justin of Rome is also known as Justin of Neapolis and here’s an example quote regarding his reliability from ancient times itself, “And Justin of Neapolis, a man who was not far separated from the apostles either in age or excellence, says that that which is mortal is inherited, but that which is immortal inherits; and that the flesh indeed dies, but the kingdom of heaven lives.— From Methodius On the Resurrection, in Photius.” (Fragments of St. Justin Martyr, Fragment 5) [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0132.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0132.htm) or here (St. Methodius of Olympus, Part 3, *From the Discourse on the Resurrection*, II. A Synopsis of Some Apostolic Words from the Same Discourse, point VI): [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0625.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0625.htm)

<sup>114</sup> St. Methodius of Olympus (died c. 311 AD) writes, “For I also, taking my journey, and going forth from the Egypt of this life, came first to the resurrection, which is the true Feast of the Tabernacles, and there having set up my tabernacle, adorned with the fruits of virtue, on the first day of the resurrection, which is the day of judgment, celebrate with Christ the millennium of rest, which is called the seventh day, even the true Sabbath. Then again from thence I, a follower of Jesus, who has entered into the heavens, Hebrews 4:14 as they also, after the rest of the Feast of Tabernacles, came into the land of promise, come into the heavens, not continuing to remain in tabernacles — that is, my body not remaining as it was before, but, after the space of a thousand years, changed from a human and corruptible form into angelic size and beauty, where at last we virgins, when the festival of the resurrection is consummated, shall pass from the wonderful place of the tabernacle to greater and better things,” (*Banquet of the Ten Virgins*, Discourse 9, Chapter 5), online source: [www.newadvent.org/fathers/062309.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/062309.htm)

Please note that St. Justin also describes this same *Chiliasm* Prophecy Timeline <sup>115</sup>. We can mix these prophetic beliefs of St. Justin and St. Irenaeus here because St. Irenaeus has already read St. Justin and approves that both of them believe the same *Chiliasm* prophecies <sup>116</sup>.

With this background information regarding a *second badge of righteous to be saved so non-elect salvation possibility*, let's return to the two Jewish proselyte classification at the start and in light of New Testament verses, perhaps these definitions can mapped and modified to mean the following *possibility*:

i) Full proselyte (*ger Tzedek*, devout proselyte)

A "devout proselyte" is a gentile/jew who has converted to Christianity, is bound to all the doctrines and precepts of the Christian religion, and is considered a full member of the Christian people. This elect salvation refers to Christians who are His bride and participate in the first resurrection as kings and priests. These are saved to inherit the new heavens with gradations of thirty, sixty and hundredfold among them where they inherit all things but have "specific difference in rewards too" who obtain celestial ("heavenly") final resurrection body at the last trumpet changing from human to no more flesh and

---

<sup>115</sup> St. Justin of Rome writes, "But I and others, who are right-minded Christians on all points, are assured that there will be a resurrection of the dead, and a thousand years in Jerusalem, which will then be built, adorned, and enlarged, [as] the prophets Ezekiel and Isaiah and others declare ... And further, there was a certain man with us, whose name was John, one of the apostles of Christ, who prophesied, by a revelation that was made to him, that those who believed in our Christ would dwell a thousand years in Jerusalem; and that thereafter the general, and, in short, the eternal resurrection and judgment of all men would likewise take place. Just as our Lord also said, 'They shall neither marry nor be given in marriage, but shall be equal to the angels, the children of the God of the resurrection.' Luke 20:35" (*Dialogue with Trypho*, chapters 80 – 81), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm)

<sup>116</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, "In his book against Marcion, Justin does well say: I would not have believed the Lord Himself, if He had announced any other than He who is our framer, maker, and nourisher. But because the only-begotten Son came to us from the one God, who both made this world and formed us, and contains and administers all things, summing up His own handiwork in Himself, my faith towards Him is steadfast, and my love to the Father immoveable, God bestowing both upon us." (*Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 6), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103406.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103406.htm)

blood during the consummation of the marriage of the Lamb at the end of the 1000 years (Millennial) reign of Christ sharing “one flesh” with Christ in some way to inherit bodily glory too.<sup>117</sup>

ii) Half proselyte (*ger toshav*, limited proselyte)

A "limited proselyte" is a gentile/jew who has *not* converted to Christianity and hence may be keeping the holiness and charity doctrine commands of Christ to some extent based on the “Parable of the Good Samaritan” (Luke 10:25 – 37) and the “Surprised Sheep of the Nations” (Matthew 25:31 – 46). These may believe in Christ after seeing (John 6:40) and hence obtain *non-elect salvation* with terrestrial (“earthly”) final resurrection body during the second resurrection and be part of the nations who are saved on the final new earth with kings reigning over them and most would not be able to enter the heavenly new Jerusalem city which descends and connects to the new earth at that time.<sup>118</sup>

## 2.11 Sheep of the Other Fold

The common definition that the “sheep of the other fold” <sup>119</sup> to mean “gentile sheep” as it is contrasted with the “sheep of the house of Israel” is found in later church fathers but surprisingly not in *Chiliasm* church fathers St. Justin of Rome and St. Irenaeus of Lyons whom I rely on for accuracy. If we look at the *Chiliasm* quotes of St. Irenaeus, we seem to see two badges of

---

<sup>117</sup> Matthew 28:19 – 20 reads, “19Go therefore and make disciples of all the nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit, 20teaching them to observe all things that I have commanded you; and lo, I am with you always, even to the end of the age. Amen” (NKJV).

<sup>118</sup> Geoffrey W. Bromiley writes, “Some scholars have claimed that the term “those who fear God” (yir’ei Elohim/Shamayim) was used in rabbinic literature to denote Gentiles who were on the fringe of the synagogue. They were not converts to Judaism, although they were attracted to the Jewish religion and observed part of the law.” (*The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia*, Fully Revised Edition, Vol. 3, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids: Michigan, ISBN 0-8028-3783-2, 1986), 1010.

<sup>119</sup> John 10:16 reads, “And other sheep I have which are not of this fold; them also I must bring, and they will hear My voice; and there will be one flock and one shepherd” (NKJV).

sheep saved but 1000 years apart <sup>120</sup> which can refer to elect salvation sheep (saved during the “times of the kingdom”) in the “first resurrection” <sup>121</sup> vs *non-elect salvation sheep* (saved during “after the times of the kingdom”) in the “general resurrection” <sup>122</sup> which is to happen at the “last trumpet” <sup>123</sup> (since there are

---

<sup>120</sup> Revelation 20:5 reads, “But the rest of the dead did not live again until the thousand years were finished. This is the first resurrection” (NKJV).

<sup>121</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “But when this Antichrist shall have devastated all things in this world, he will reign for three years and six months, and sit in the temple at Jerusalem; and then the Lord will come from heaven in the clouds, in the glory of the Father, sending this man and those who follow him into the lake of fire; **but bringing in for the righteous the times of the kingdom**, that is, the rest, the hallowed seventh day; and restoring to Abraham the promised inheritance, in which kingdom the Lord declared, that many coming from the east and from the west should sit down with Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob. Matthew 8:11” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 30), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103530.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103530.htm) and “For **in the times of the kingdom**, the righteous man who is upon the earth shall then forget to die. ... 3. John, therefore, did distinctly foresee the **first resurrection of the just**, Luke 14:14 and the inheritance in the kingdom of the earth; and what the prophets have prophesied concerning it harmonize [with his vision]. For the Lord also taught these things, when He promised that He would have the mixed cup new with His disciples in the kingdom. (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, chapter 36), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103536.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103536.htm) and “For what are the hundred-fold [rewards] in this word, the entertainments given to the poor, and the suppers for which a return is made? These are [to take place] in the **times of the kingdom**, that is, upon the seventh day, ... The predicted blessing, therefore, belongs unquestionably to the **times of the kingdom**, when the **righteous shall bear rule upon their rising from the dead**; when also the creation, having been renovated and set free, shall fructify with an abundance of all kinds of food, from the dew of heaven, and from the fertility of the earth: as the elders who saw John, the disciple of the Lord, related that they had heard from him how the Lord used to teach in regard to these times” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 33), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103533.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103533.htm)

<sup>122</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “And in the **Apocalypse** John saw this new [Jerusalem] descending upon the new earth. Revelation 21:2 For **after the times of the kingdom**, he says, I saw a great white throne, and Him who sat upon it, from whose face the earth fled away, and the heavens; and there was no more place for them. Revelation 20:11 And he sets forth, too, the things connected with the **general resurrection** and the judgment, mentioning the dead, great and small.” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 35), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103535.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103535.htm) and “But inasmuch as one and the same Lord has pointed out that the **whole human race** shall be divided at the judgment, as a shepherd divides the **sheep** from the goats, Matthew 25:32 and that to some He will say, Come, you blessed of My Father, receive the kingdom which has been prepared for you, Matthew 25:34 but to others, Depart from me, you cursed, into everlasting fire, which My Father has prepared for the devil and his angels, Matthew 25:41” (*Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 40), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103440.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103440.htm)

<sup>123</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “1. Let our **opponents** — that is, they who speak against **their own salvation**— inform us [as to this point] ... that His words concerning its [future] **resurrection** may also be believed; so also at the **end**, when the Lord utters His voice by the **last trumpet**, 1 Corinthians 15:52 **the dead shall be raised**, as He Himself declares: The **hour shall come**, in which **all**

only two trumpets for two resurrections), hence the latter could be the *sheep of the other fold*.

Both St. Justin <sup>124</sup> and St. Irenaeus <sup>125</sup> called the “gentile sheep” as “spotted or coloured sheep” instead of “sheep of other fold” label. This is important because spotted/coloured speaks about a physical difference on the sheep’s body (like a race) while the Koine Greek word translated as “fold” is αὐλῆς [transliterated: aulēs] <sup>126</sup> which is referring to something external namely the “house for the sheep or sheep pen” and not a physical mark on its body. This means that elect salvation sheepfold1 belongs to “house/fold in final new heavens” while in contrast the *non-elect salvation* sheepfold2 belongs to “house/fold in final new earth” which matches our previous *possibility* discussions perfectly.

Around this time, Clement of Alexandria calls the “sheep of other fold” <sup>127</sup> to refer to some which undergo afterlife

---

**the dead** which are in the tombs shall hear the voice of the Son of man, and shall come forth; **those that have done good to the resurrection of life**, and those that have done evil to the resurrection of judgment. John 5:28” (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 13), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103513.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103513.htm)

- <sup>124</sup> St. Justin of Rome writes, “And it was foretold what each should be according to rank and according to fore-knowledge. Jacob served Laban for **speckled and many-spotted sheep**; and Christ served, even to the slavery of the cross, for the **various and many-formed races of mankind**, acquiring them by the blood and mystery of the cross.” (*Dialogue with Trypho*, Chapter 134), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/01289.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/01289.htm)
- <sup>125</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “In a foreign country were the twelve tribes born, the **race of Israel**, inasmuch as Christ was also, in a strange country, to generate the twelve-pillared foundation of the Church. **Various colored sheep** were allotted to this Jacob as his wages; and the wages of Christ are **human beings**, who **from various and diverse nations** come together into one cohort of faith,” (*Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 21), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103421.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103421.htm).
- <sup>126</sup> 833 aule {ow-lay'} from the same as 109; a yard (as open to the wind); by implication, a mansion:--court, (sheep-)fold, hall, palace. (Strong, James. *Strong's Exhaustive Concordance*, 1890, public domain), 61,
- <sup>127</sup> St. Clement of Alexandria (c. 150 AD – c. 215 AD) writes, “And **other sheep** there are also, says the Lord, which are **not of this fold** John 10:16 — deemed **worthy of another fold and mansion**, in proportion to their faith. ... but though he quit the flesh, he must put off the passions, so as to be capable of reaching his own mansion. ... he greatest torments, indeed, are assigned to the believer. For God's righteousness is good, and His goodness is righteous. And though the punishments cease in the course of the completion of the expiation and purification of each one, yet those have very great and permanent grief who are found worthy of the **other fold**, on account of not being along with those that have been glorified through righteousness.” (*The Stromata*, Book 6, Chapter 14), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/02106.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/02106.htm)

judgments and are placed in a more inferior final place which Catholics use in support of purgatory.

The most interesting quote regarding the “sheep of other fold” is by St. Irenaeus of Lyons <sup>128</sup> which is difficult to decipher because he seems to quote a point which the gnostic heretics are right namely “they also affirm that the Saviour came to the lost sheep, in order to transfer it to the right hand, that is, to the ninety and nine sheep which were in safety, and perished not, but continued within the fold, yet were of the left hand,” but then continues to condemn their error of some type of numerology where he says that since those words assigned as a “label” to certain things on the left hand/other fold/lost sheep does not sum up to 100 but perhaps only ninety something then these remain in corruption or unsaved (implied) in his words here, “they must acknowledge that the enjoyment of rest did not imply salvation”.

This “transfer” from “left hand to right hand” seems to fit the Judgment Day description of Matthew 25:31 – 46 when Christ separates the sheep from the goats placing the former in His Right Hand while the latter at His Left Hand (notice that Christ only does this during their resurrection where these sheep and goats are mingled meaning both are raised simultaneously hence more likely to be second resurrection timeline). Also, St. Irenaeus’ choice of words here seem to match these Verses (and his earlier quotes agree too). Another key point is to notice that these sheep are only saved during the second resurrection after

---

<sup>128</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “6. But further, as to their calling material substances on the left hand, and maintaining that those things which are thus on the left hand of necessity fall into corruption, while they also affirm that the Saviour came to the lost sheep, in order to transfer it to the right hand, that is, to the ninety and nine sheep which were in safety, and perished not, but continued within the fold, yet were of the left hand, it follows that they must acknowledge that the enjoyment of rest did not imply salvation. And that which has not in like manner the same number, they will be compelled to acknowledge as belonging to the left hand, that is, to corruption. ... And thus, in fine, they will be compelled to acknowledge that all those sacred names which do not reach a numerical value of one hundred, but only contain the numbers summed by the left hand, are corruptible and material.” (*Against Heresies*, Book 2, Chapter 24), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103224.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103224.htm)

this transfer and so seems to be *non-elect salvation* of sheep of other fold since the elect sheep are saved 1000 years already by now having participated in the first resurrection.

Such an idea of *non-elect salvation* for some after judgment is found in a non-canonical Jewish writing called the *Apocalypse of Abraham*. Though not canonical, such writings demonstrate that such ideas are within the realm of possibilities especially if they can match say in this case the “transfer from left hand to right hand after judgment to be restored and saved by judgment day”<sup>129</sup> as St. Irenaeus of Lyons’ quote seems to mean likewise.

All these raises a question namely, does St. Irenaeus have a quote which can potentially describe salvation of some sheep being saved in the spirit world context?

In a writing, St. Irenaeus seems to mention those “saved” Israel sheep on earth (hence elect salvation) while comparing the “lost sheep of Israel which has perished”<sup>130</sup> indicating that the “sheep of other fold” could be those not saved on earth itself (hence *non-elect salvation*). This is not a far fetched guess because in another writing, St. Irenaeus writes using the same phrase “seeking the sheep which had perished” in the context

---

<sup>129</sup> *Apocalypse of Abraham* reads, “A Vision of Sin and Paradise: the Mirror of the World (Chapter XXI). XXI. ... And I saw there the Garden of Eden and its fruits, the source<sup>4</sup> of the stream issuing from it, and its trees and their bloom, and those who behaved righteously. And I saw therein their foods and blessedness. 5 And I saw there a great multitude—men and women and children [half of them on the right side of the picture]<sup>6</sup> and half of them on the left side of the picture.<sup>7</sup> The Fall of Man and its Sequel (Chapters XXII-XXV.). XXII. ... ”<sup>10</sup> And I said: “O Lord, mighty and eternal! Who are the people in this picture on this side and on that?” And He said to me: “These which are on the left side are the multitude of the peoples which have formerly been in existence and which are after thee destined,<sup>1</sup> some for judgement and restoration, and others for vengeance and destruction at the end of the world.<sup>2</sup> But these which are on the right side of the picture—they are the people set apart for me of the peoples with Azazel.<sup>3</sup> These are they whom I have ordained to be born of thee and to be called My People.” (Chapters 21 – 22, via Society for promoting Christian Knowledge, translated by G.H. Box, London, Macmillan Company, 1919), 42 – 44; [www.marquette.edu/maqom/box.pdf](http://www.marquette.edu/maqom/box.pdf)

<sup>130</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “8. But as many as feared God, and were anxious about His law, these ran to Christ, and were all saved. For He said to His disciples: Go to the sheep of the house of Israel, Matthew 10:6 which have perished.” (*Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 2), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103402.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103402.htm)

of spirit world salvation <sup>131</sup> attaching it to these phrases “descend to those things which are of the earth beneath” (indicating spirit world <sup>132</sup>) and saved only after judgment there as he also writes this phrase “remaining part of the body — [namely, the body] of everyman who is found in life — when the time is fulfilled of that condemnation which existed by reason of disobedience, may arise,” whilst describing the salvation of such lost sheep.

## **2.12 Indian Evidence – Sadhu Sundar Singh and DGS Dhinakaran**

Dr. D.G.S. Dhinakaran (1 July 1935 – 20 February 2008) was Founder of *Jesus Calls* ministry and a famous evangelical preacher in India. Sadhu Sundar Singh (3 September 1889 – 1929) was a famous Christian in India who influenced the faith of many Indian Christians through his life and writings. Sundar Singh mysteriously disappeared into the Himalayas in 1929 never to be seen again. Sundar Singh claims that Christ appeared to him and caused his conversion after he had hated Christianity, burned a Bible and wanted to commit suicide on a railway line<sup>133</sup>.

Sundar Singh believed in *non-elect salvation*<sup>134</sup> and claimed to have seen direct visions in the spirit world of it happening. In

---

<sup>131</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, “and descend to those things which are of the earth beneath, seeking the sheep which had perished, which was indeed His own peculiar handiwork ... as the Head rose from the dead, so also the remaining part of the body — [namely, the body] of everyman who is found in life — when the time is fulfilled of that condemnation which existed by reason of disobedience, may arise, ... each of the members having its own proper and fit position in the body. For there are many mansions in the Father’s house, John 14:2 inasmuch as there are also many members in the body.” (*Against Heresies*, Book 3, Chapter 19), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103319.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103319.htm)

<sup>132</sup> Ephesians 4:9 – 10 reads, “9(Now this, “He ascended”—what does it mean but that He also first descended into the lower parts of the earth? 10He who descended is also the One who ascended far above all the heavens, that He might fill all things” (NKJV).

<sup>133</sup> Cyril J. Davey. *The Story of Sadhu Sundar Singh* (Chicago: Moody Press, 1963), 32-33.

<sup>134</sup> Sadhu Sundar Singh said, “I was also told that the love of God operates even in Hell. God does not shine in His full light, because those there could not bear it, but He gradually shows them more and more light, and by and by brings them on



one instance, Sundar Singh saw a relatively good atheist saved in the Spirit World after some judgment time<sup>135</sup>. In another instance Sundar Singh saw a relatively good Hindu-idolater saved in the Spirit World too<sup>136</sup>. Despite all this, Dr. D.G.S.

---

and moves their conscience towards something better, although they think that the desire is entirely their own. Thus God works on their minds from within, something in the same way, though in the opposite direction, as that in which Satan suggests temptation to us here. Thus, what with God's work within and the Light without, almost all those in Hell will ultimately be brought to Christ's feet. It will perhaps take millions of ages, but when it is attained they will be full of joy and thankfulness towards God ; though they will still be less happy than those who have accepted Christ on earth. ...At least, that is the case with the majority, but there are some few personalities, Satan for instance, in regard to whom I was told, ' Don't ask about them.' And so I didn't like to ask, but I hoped that for them also there was some hope. " They also told me that the Saints help in the work of saving souls in Hell, because there can be no idleness in Heaven. Those in Hell will ultimately be brought to Heaven like the prodigal son, but with regard to the ultimate fate of a certain number you must not ask." [The Sadhu is inclined to think that perhaps these few will be annihilated]. " Once I said, 'So many people will be lost because they have not heard of Christ.' They said, ' The contrary will be the case ; very few will be lost.' There is a kind of heavenly joke - no, joke is not a good word for it. 'Very few will be lost but many will be saved.'" (Streeter, Burnett and A. J. Appasamy. *The Sadhu: a Study in Mysticism and Practical Religion*. London: Macmillan, 1923), 100 – 102. Available online (pages 128 – 130 instead): [endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/The\\_Sadhu-Streeter\\_and\\_Appasamy.pdf](http://endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/The_Sadhu-Streeter_and_Appasamy.pdf) .

<sup>135</sup> Sadhu Sundar Singh wrote (in Urdu), "DEATH OF A PHILOSOPHER ... The soul of a German philosopher entered into the world of spirits ... I asked one of the angels what the end of this man would be, and he replied "If this man's life had been altogether bad, then he would at once have joined the spirits of darkness, but he is not without a moral sense, so for a very long time he will wander blindly round in the dim light of the lower parts of the intermediate state, and keep on bumping his philosophical head, until tired of his foolishness, he repents. Then he will be ready to receive the necessary instruction from the angels appointed for that purpose, and, when instructed, will he be fit to enter into the fuller light of God in the higher sphere." (*Visions of the Spiritual World*, Translated by Rev. T. E. Riddle of the New Zealand Presbyterian Mission, Kharar, Punjab, from Urdu into English, Macmillan Co., 1926), 4 – 5, [endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/Visions\\_of\\_the\\_Spiritual\\_World\\_by\\_Sadhu\\_Sundar\\_Singh.pdf](http://endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/Visions_of_the_Spiritual_World_by_Sadhu_Sundar_Singh.pdf)

<sup>136</sup> Sadhu Sundar Singh wrote (in Urdu), "THE MANIFESTATION OF CHRIST ... I saw in a vision the spirit of an idolater on reaching the world of spirits begin at once to search for his god. Then the saints said to him, "There is no god here save the One True God, and Christ, who is His manifestation." At this, the man was a good deal astonished, but being a sincere seeker after truth, he frankly admitted that he had been in error. He eagerly sought to know the correct view of truth, and asked if he might see the Christ. Shortly after this Christ manifested Himself in a dim light to him, and to others who had newly arrived in the world of spirits, ... So, when these spirits saw Christ in this dim but attractive light, they were filled with a joy and peace ... all their error was washed away. Then with all their hearts, they acknowledged Him as the Truth, and found healing, and, bowing in lowly adoration before Him, thanked and praised Him. And the saints, who had been appointed for their instruction; also rejoiced over them." (*Visions of the Spiritual World*, Translated by Rev. T. E. Riddle of the New Zealand Presbyterian Mission, Kharar, Punjab, from Urdu into English, Macmillan Co., 1926), 6,

Dhinakaran claimed to have seen Sadhu Sundar Singh in heaven<sup>137</sup>.

Now Sundar Singh claimed to have seen Swedenborg during his spirit world visions and they even spoke about some type of *non-elect salvation*<sup>138</sup>.

Swedenborg (29 January 1688 – 29 March 1772) claimed to have seen St. Augustine of Hippo during his spirit world visits<sup>139</sup> and believed in *non-elect salvation* even in his lifetime<sup>140</sup>.

---

[endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/Visions\\_of\\_the\\_Spiritual\\_World\\_by\\_Sadhu\\_Sundar\\_Singh.pdf](http://endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/Visions_of_the_Spiritual_World_by_Sadhu_Sundar_Singh.pdf)

<sup>137</sup> Dr. D.G.S. Dhinakaran writes, “There were occasions when the Lord enabled me to have some time in the Second Heaven with Sadhu Sundar Singh, the great and acclaimed Saint of India. The divine joy that was reflected on his face is beyond any description.” (*An Insight Into Heaven*, True Friend Management Support Service Pvt. Ltd., 2007), 101.

<sup>138</sup> Sadhu Sundar Singh writes, “Yes, I have talked with the venerable Swedenborg and some other saints and angels about the hells, although I am unable to explain adequately all that they told me. But it is somewhat like this ; No spirit can exist forever, if separated from God by sin or evil. It must either cease to exist or return to God who is the source of life. There is no spirit which will ever cease to exist ; therefore every spirit finally must return to God, even though it may be after ages of ages.” (Appasamy, A. J. *Sundar Singh*. Cambridge: Lutterworth, 1958), 216, [archive.org/stream/in.ernet.dli.2015.51820/2015.51820.Sundar-Singh-A-Biography-1958\\_djvu.txt](http://archive.org/stream/in.ernet.dli.2015.51820/2015.51820.Sundar-Singh-A-Biography-1958_djvu.txt)

<sup>139</sup> Emanuel Swedenborg wrote, “I have several times talked with Augustine, who was bishop of Hippo in Africa, in the third century. He said that he is there at this time, inspiring them with the worship of the Lord, and that there is hope that this new gospel will be extended into the surrounding regions. I have heard the angels rejoicing over that revelation, because through it there is being opened to them a communication with the human rational, hitherto closed up by the universal dogma that the understanding must be kept in obedience to the faith of the ministers of the church.” (*True Christian Religion*, by Emanuel Swedenborg, [1771], tr. by John C. Ager [1906]), section 840, [sacred-texts.com/swd/tcr/tcr17.htm](http://sacred-texts.com/swd/tcr/tcr17.htm) .

<sup>140</sup> Emanuel Swedenborg wrote, “The Papists in the spiritual world appear round about and beneath the Protestants, and separated from them by inter-spaces which they are forbidden to pass, although the monks by clandestine arts secure for themselves a way through, and also send out emissaries by hidden paths to make converts; but they are traced out, and after being punished, are either sent back to their companions or cast down. ... The Mohammedans, like all nations who acknowledge one God, love justice and do good from religion, have their own heaven, but it is outside of the Christian heaven. The Mohammedan heaven, however, is divided into two. In the lower they live uprightly with several wives; but only those who give up their concubines and acknowledge the Lord our Savior, and also His dominion over heaven and hell, are raised up from this into their higher heaven. I have heard that it is impossible for them to conceive of God the Father and our Lord as one, but that it is possible for them to believe that the Lord rules over the heavens and the hells because He is the Son of God the

## Conclusion

Many Pentecostals really believe in Dr. D.G.S. Dhinakaran's claim of going to heaven and seeing even Sadhu Sundar Singh. This means either Sundar Singh's *non-elect salvation* quotes are true or if wrong, they don't affect salvation at all (because quite a number of Christians and non-Christians have either believed or been affected by Sundar Singh's *non-elect salvation* quotes shown prior).

As for me, though I present the evidence strongly and I hope that *non-elect salvation* possibility turns out to be true, but yet I can only stand neutral still in regard to things which I cannot know for sure until I die and meet the Lord.

I often take this neutral stance on matters of prophecy but present the evidence for the side which I think is more probable so that I don't accidentally mislead anyone and have already told them all these facts in advance.

St. Justin of Rome has written that no Christian goes to heaven <sup>141</sup> until after the resurrection because we need that "change" from "human" to "no more flesh and blood" celestial body to be able to "enter the final heavens" which is the "change" from "natural body" to "spiritual body" <sup>142</sup> for the elect at the last trumpet.

---

Father. It is because of their holding this belief that it is granted them by the Lord to ascend into the higher heaven. ... " (*True Christian Religion*, by Emanuel Swedenborg, [1771], tr. by John C. Ager [1906]), section 817, 832, [sacred-texts.com/swd/tcr/tcr17.htm](http://sacred-texts.com/swd/tcr/tcr17.htm)

<sup>141</sup> St. Justin of Rome writes, "For if you have fallen in with some who are called Christians, but who do not admit this [truth], and venture to blaspheme the God of Abraham, and the God of Isaac, and the God of Jacob; who say there is no resurrection of the dead, and that their souls, when they die, are taken to heaven; do not imagine that they are Christians" (*Dialogue with Trypho*, Chapter 80), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm)

<sup>142</sup> 1 Corinthians 15:44, 46, 49, reads, "44It is sown a natural body, it is raised a spiritual body. There is a natural body, and there is a spiritual body. 46However, the spiritual is not first, but the natural, and afterward the spiritual. 49And as we have borne the image of the man of dust, we shall also bear the image of the heavenly Man" (NKJV).

This is only understood accurately like this if we take all the *Chiliasm* church father quotes as a whole to understand what he failed to write explicitly. St. Justin is not denying that some can have heavenly visions if God permits it (2 Corinthians 12:2) but rather is writing against those who say they that there is no bodily resurrection (in flesh and blood first) and can live in the heavens permanently in a spirit state.

This is further substantiated by Lord Jesus Christ's own Resurrection where as a "Spirit" He did not go to "heaven" <sup>143</sup> yet and could only do so after "Bodily Resurrection" <sup>144</sup>.

Christ's Resurrection Body is not merely flesh and blood but beyond and when we rise from the dead, we are not immediately conformed to it yet until the marriage of the Lamb (that's one of the purpose for it) is complete after the 1000 years and our body sharing "one flesh" with Christ's is "transformed into some glory" <sup>145</sup> as per *Chiliasm* quotes shown earlier.

Roman Catholics like to quote both St. Irenaeus of Lyons <sup>146</sup> and Tertullian <sup>147</sup> for unity quotes and that they are the church

---

<sup>143</sup> John 20:17 reads, 'Jesus said to her, "Do not cling to Me, for I have not yet ascended to My Father; but go to My brethren and say to them, 'I am ascending to My Father and your Father, and to My God and your God.'" ' (NKJV).

<sup>144</sup> Acts 1:9 – 11 reads, "9Now when He had spoken these things, while they watched, He was taken up, and a cloud received Him out of their sight. 10And while they looked steadfastly toward heaven as He went up, behold, two men stood by them in white apparel, 11who also said, "Men of Galilee, why do you stand gazing up into heaven? This same Jesus, who was taken up from you into heaven, will so come in like manner as you saw Him go into heaven.'"(NKJV).

<sup>145</sup> Philippians 3:21 reads, "who will transform our lowly body that it may be conformed to His glorious body," (NKJV).

<sup>146</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, "1. Now all these [heretics] are of much later date than the bishops to whom the apostles committed the Churches; which fact I have in the third book taken all pains to demonstrate. It follows, then, as a matter of course, that these heretics aforementioned, since they are blind to the truth, and deviate from the [right] way, will walk in various roads; and therefore the footsteps of their doctrine are scattered here and there without agreement or connection. But the path of those belonging to the Church circumscribes the whole world, as possessing the sure tradition from the apostles, and gives unto us to see that the faith of all is one and the same," (*Against Heresies*, Book 5, Chapter 20), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103520.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103520.htm)

<sup>147</sup> Tertullian writes, "But if there be any (heresies) which are bold enough to plant themselves in the midst of the apostolic age, that they may thereby seem to have been handed down by the apostles, because they existed in the time of the

with direct spiritual descent from the apostles themselves. The problem here is that the “Original Catholic Churches” at the time of their writing is quoted to believe even in *Chiliasm* quotes which they have written, right? So if even one quote of theirs is not believed or is different from what the Catholic church believes today, then doesn’t that prove that either diversity was allowed and a tradition or an interpretation which prevailed has been dominant proving human free will? Isn’t this same spiritual phenomena observable with the Jews themselves in that they had preserved Scripture, ensured the continuity and function of Levitical priesthood and converted many into Judaism for thousands of years but yet were wrong on many doctrinal points by the time of Christ, some even disbelieving Him?

My point is that majority in number of converts and prevalence of any doctrine or interpretation is not necessarily a sign of truth. For me, the earliest surviving writings of Christianity which mainly involves these *Chiliasm* church fathers, St. Irenaeus of Lyons, St. Justin of Rome and Tertullian seems to preserve the ancient faith most accurately and where they differ, these could be *possibilities* but I prefer St. Irenaeus and St. Justin over Tertullian since even the Roman Catholics have noticed some errors in Tertullian and so he is not sainted.

This same St. Clement of Rome (c. 35 AD – c. 99 AD) or Pope Clement I for Roman Catholics who is a direct disciple of apostle St. Peter himself has written a letter that is known as 1 Clement today which is considered Scripture in some early Christianity

---

apostles, we can say: Let them produce the original records of their churches; let them unfold the roll of their bishops, running down in due succession from the beginning in such a manner that [that first bishop of theirs ] bishop shall be able to show for his ordainer and predecessor some one of the apostles or of apostolic men, — a man, moreover, who continued steadfast with the apostles. For this is the manner in which the apostolic churches transmit their registers: as the church of Smyrna, which records that Polycarp was placed therein by John; as also the church of Rome, which makes Clement to have been ordained in like manner by Peter.” (*Prescription against Heretics*, Chapter 32), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0311.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0311.htm)

such as the 5th century Codex Alexandrinus <sup>148</sup> and is even mentioned by St. Irenaeus of Lyons as an authentic tradition from the apostles <sup>149</sup> that has a verse which almost sounds like a prophecy <sup>150</sup> and states that sometimes the person who leaves the church could be more accurate doctrinally despite the ruling of the majority. This is a clear proof of freewill practice which God has allowed even in the area of doctrinal accuracy in a Church.

In other words, St. Clement of Rome basically states that doctrinal accuracy may not always be found in the majority and a person who leaves a Church because of that will attain to great honour and glory in the Lord provided he turned out right <sup>151</sup>. So knowing this should encourage each Christian to be more united and not worry about the approval of masses whenever they stand for some doctrinal accuracy be It in practice or in theory and especially in prophecy aspect too.

How does God's Will play a role in number of converts for a particular denomination then? Personally, I believe that God allows the leaders we deserve. I mean if more Christians are

---

<sup>148</sup> Aland, Kurt; Aland, Barbara. *The Text of the New Testament: An Introduction to the Critical Editions and to the Theory and Practice of Modern Textual Criticism*. Erroll F. Rhodes (trans.). Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, ISBN 978-0-8028-4098-1, 1995) 107, 109.

<sup>149</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, "for there were many still remaining who had received instructions from the apostles. In the time of this Clement, no small dissension having occurred among the brethren at Corinth, the Church in Rome dispatched a most powerful letter to the Corinthians, exhorting them to peace, renewing their faith, and declaring the tradition which it had lately received from the apostles," (*Against Heresies*, Book 3, Chapter 3), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103303.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103303.htm)

<sup>150</sup> St. Clement of Rome writes, "Who then among you is noble-minded? Who compassionate? Who full of love? Let him declare, If on my account sedition and disagreement and schisms have arisen, I will depart, I will go away wherever ye desire, and I will do whatever the majority commands; only let the flock of Christ live on terms of peace with the presbyters set over it. He that acts thus shall procure to himself great glory in the Lord; and every place will welcome him. For the earth is the Lord's, and the fullness thereof. These things they who live a godly life that is never to be repented of, both have done and always will do." (*1 Clement*, Chapter 54), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/1010.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/1010.htm)

<sup>151</sup> Luke 6:22 – 23 reads, "22Blessed are you when men hate you, and when they exclude you, and revile you, and cast out your name as evil, for the Son of Man's sake. 23Rejoice in that day and leap for joy! For indeed your reward is great in heaven, for in like manner their fathers did to the prophets" (NKJV).

zealous for God in regards to accuracy and practice at St. Irenaeus of Lyons' level, then we will get a leader who believes the same as him and vice versa <sup>152</sup>. In fact, prophet Daniel has prophesied that though leading many to righteousness is a great thing but even that shines like the "stars" (lower level) whereas having doctrinal accuracy or "insight" say in prophecy too can result in that final resurrection body glory to inherit the glory like the "heavens" (higher level) <sup>153</sup>. Even St. Irenaeus of Lyons knew that Daniel 12:3 speaks of this glory relating to final resurrection body context <sup>154</sup> based on how much insight in prophecy and/or doctrinal accuracy a disciple of Christ has which remains forever and ever. So we as Christians should try our best to be accurate and let God decide who shines like heavens and who shine like stars in the end. God has warned through Prophet Jeremiah that in the context of prophecy/oracle, if one claims that it's one's own attempt, even if it turned out wrong it's okay since His Name was not taken in vain <sup>155</sup>. However, if a prophet claims that "God told me so" but He didn't or that it turned out wrong, then such a person is liable to "eternal" shame or judgment of some sort (in fact, the Hebrew word *olam* which is translated as "everlasting and perpetual" here appears twice showing its seriousness) <sup>156</sup>.

---

<sup>152</sup> Romans 10:2 reads, "For I bear them witness that they have a zeal for God, but not according to knowledge" (NKJV).

<sup>153</sup> Daniel 12:3 reads, "And those who have insight will shine like the glow of the expanse of heaven, and those who lead the many to righteousness, like the stars forever and ever" (NASB).

<sup>154</sup> St. Irenaeus of Lyons writes, "preaching by anticipation the inheritance of the holy Jerusalem, and proclaiming beforehand that the man who loves God shall arrive at such excellency as even to see God, and hear His word, and from the hearing of His discourse be glorified to such an extent, that others cannot behold the glory of his countenance, as was said by Daniel: Those who do understand, shall shine as the brightness of the firmament, and many of the righteous as the stars for ever and ever. Daniel 12:3 Thus, then, I have shown it to be, if any one read the Scriptures." (*Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 26), [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103426.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103426.htm)

<sup>155</sup> Jeremiah 23:36 reads, "And the oracle of the LORD you shall mention no more. For every man's word will be his oracle, for you have perverted the words of the living God, the LORD of hosts, our God" (NKJV).

<sup>156</sup> Jeremiah 23:38 – 40 reads, "38But since you say, 'The oracle of the Lord!' therefore thus says the Lord: 'Because you say this word, "The oracle of the Lord!" and I have sent to you, saying, "Do not say, 'The oracle of the Lord!'" 39therefore behold, I, even I, will utterly forget you and forsake you, and the city that I gave

If *non-elect salvation* turns out to be true, then the “few” saved refers to Elect Salvation <sup>157</sup> who become His Bride <sup>158</sup> and enter heaven <sup>159</sup> while Christ’s Ransom for “many” <sup>160</sup> includes those of *non-elect salvation* too who get the final abode on the final new earth only <sup>161</sup> and are called by the Bride to take the water of life <sup>162</sup> which flows freely into the final new earth in this final scene and “healing from the leaves of the tree of life” whose Source is Christ <sup>163</sup> is needed for those *non-elect salvation* of the nations since they could just be “saved by fire” <sup>164</sup> (note that Christians are already resurrected and saved for 1000 years when this happens in *Chiliasm* timeline and so the possibility that a Christian is requiring the “healing from the leaves of the tree of life” in this final scene seems difficult to accept, right?) Maybe this is what is meant by prophet Daniel <sup>165</sup> that “many” shall be “purified” meaning “saved by fire”. Hence *non-elect salvation* could explain why some sayings or conclusion type

---

you and your fathers, and will cast you out of My presence. 40And I will bring an everlasting reproach upon you, and a perpetual shame, which shall not be forgotten.’” (NKJV).

<sup>157</sup> Matthew 7:14 reads, “Because narrow is the gate and difficult is the way which leads to life, and there are few who find it” (NKJV).

<sup>158</sup> Revelation 21:9 reads partly, “Come, I will show you the bride, the Lamb’s wife” (NKJV).

<sup>159</sup> Matthew 7:21 reads, “21“Not everyone who says to Me, ‘Lord, Lord,’ shall enter the kingdom of heaven, but he who does the will of My Father in heaven” (NKJV).

<sup>160</sup> Matthew 26:28 reads, “For this is My blood of the new covenant, which is shed for many for the remission of sins” (NKJV).

<sup>161</sup> Revelation 21:24, 27 reads, “24And the nations of those who are saved shall walk in its light, and the kings of the earth bring their glory and honor into it. 27But there shall by no means enter it anything that defiles, or causes an abomination or a lie, but only those who are written in the Lamb’s Book of Life” (NKJV).

<sup>162</sup> Revelation 22:17 reads, “17And the Spirit and the bride say, “Come!” And let him who hears say, “Come!” And let him who thirsts come. Whoever desires, let him take the water of life freely” (NKJV).

<sup>163</sup> Revelation 22:1 – 2 reads, “1And he showed me a pure river of water of life, clear as crystal, proceeding from the throne of God and of the Lamb. 2In the middle of its street, and on either side of the river, was the tree of life, which bore twelve fruits, each tree yielding its fruit every month. The leaves of the tree were for the healing of the nations” (NKJV).

<sup>164</sup> 1 Corinthians 3:15 reads, “If anyone’s work is burned, he will suffer loss; but he himself will be saved, yet so as through fire” (NKJV).

<sup>165</sup> Daniel 12:10 reads, “Many shall be purified, made white, and refined, but the wicked shall do wickedly; and none of the wicked shall understand, but the wise shall understand” (NKJV).



Bible verses seem to hint at a larger group to be saved <sup>166</sup> where believers are a subset of it<sup>167</sup>. Even St. Jerome of the Vulgate (c. 347 AD – c. 420 AD) highlights the importance of doctrinal accuracy using the context of Daniel 12:3<sup>168</sup>. I will end this discussion by quoting the “Septuagint (LXX)” for these prophecy Verses from Daniel below which can be compared against the “Masoretic”<sup>169</sup>.

“2And many of them that sleep in the dust of the earth shall awake, some to everlasting life, and some to reproach and everlasting shame. 3And the wise shall shine as the brightness of the firmament, and some of the many righteous as the stars for ever and ever. .... 10Many must be tested, and thoroughly whitened, and tried with fire, and sanctified; but the transgressors shall transgress and none of the transgressors

---

<sup>166</sup> 1 Timothy 2:4 reads, “3 For this is good and acceptable in the sight of God our Saviour; 4 Who will have all men to be saved, and to come unto the knowledge of the truth” (KJV).

<sup>167</sup> 1 Timothy 4:10 reads, “For therefore we both labour and suffer reproach, because we trust in the living God, who is the Saviour of all men, specially of those that believe” (KJV).

<sup>168</sup> St. Jerome of the Vulgate writes, “But the teachers shall resemble the very heavens, and those who have instructed others shall be compared to the brightness of the stars. For it is not enough to know wisdom unless one also instructs others; and the tongue of instruction which remains silent and edifies no one else can receive no reward for labor accomplished. This passage is expressed by Theodo-tion and the Vulgate edition [of the Septuagint] in the following | 147 fashion: “And those who understand shall shine forth like the radiance of the firmament, and many of the righteous like the stars forever and ever.” Many people often ask whether a learned saint and an ordinary saint shall both enjoy the same reward and one and the same dwelling-place in heaven. Well then, the statement is made here, according to Theodotion’s rendering, that the learned will resemble the very heavens, whereas the righteous who are without learning are only compared to the brightness of the stars. And so the difference between learned godliness and mere godly rusticity shall be the difference between heaven and the stars” (*Commentary on Daniel*, Chapter 12, translated by Gleason L. Archer, 1958), 15-157, [www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\\_daniel\\_02\\_text.htm](http://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome_daniel_02_text.htm)

<sup>169</sup> Daniel 12:2 – 3, 10, translated based on the Masoretic text reads, “2And many of those who sleep in the dust of the earth shall awake, some to everlasting life, some to shame and everlasting contempt. 3Those who are wise shall shine like the brightness of the firmament, and those who turn many to righteousness like the stars forever and ever. ... 10Many shall be purified, made white, and refined, but the wicked shall do wickedly; and none of the wicked shall understand, but the wise shall understand.” (NKJV).

shall understand; but the wise shall understand” (Daniel 12:2–3,10, Brenton Septuagint translation <sup>170</sup>).

## Sources

### ***Internet links throughout this article were accessed August, 2024***

- Aland, Kurt; Aland, Barbara. *The Text of the New Testament: An Introduction to the Critical Editions and to the Theory and Practice of Modern Textual Criticism*. Erroll F. Rhodes (trans.). Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, ISBN 978-0-8028-4098-1, 1995).
- Appasamy, A. J. *Sundar Singh*. Cambridge: Lutterworth, 1958.  
[archive.org/stream/in.ernet.dli.2015.51820/2015.51820.Sundar-Singh-A-Biography-1958\\_djvu.txt](http://archive.org/stream/in.ernet.dli.2015.51820/2015.51820.Sundar-Singh-A-Biography-1958_djvu.txt)
- Berlin, Meyer; Zevin, Shlomo Yosef. *Encyclopedia Talmudica: A Digest of Halachic Literature and Jewish Law from the Tannaïtic Period to the Present Time, Alphabetically Arranged*. Vol. IV. Jerusalem: Yad Harav Herzog (Emet, ISBN 0873067142, eds. (1992) [1969]).
- Bible Canon: *Codex Sinaiticus*.  
[codexsinaiticus.org/en/codex/content.aspx](http://codexsinaiticus.org/en/codex/content.aspx)
- Bible. Unless noted, all Scripture is taken from the *New King James Version* (NKJV). Nashville: Published by Thomas Nelson, 1996, c1982. NKJV and other translations used are [biblehub.com](http://biblehub.com)
- Brenton. *Septuagint*. Daniel 12 (LXX).  
[biblehub.com/sep/daniel/12.htm](http://biblehub.com/sep/daniel/12.htm)
- Catechism of the Catholic Church. CCC 1821. [http://www.catholic-catechism.com/ccc\\_1.74.618.851.956.1256.1261.1349.1821.1900.2240.2574.2634.2822.htm](http://www.catholic-catechism.com/ccc_1.74.618.851.956.1256.1261.1349.1821.1900.2240.2574.2634.2822.htm)
- Catholic Encyclopaedia, *Hermas*. [www.catholic.com/encyclopedia/hermas](http://www.catholic.com/encyclopedia/hermas)
- Catholic Encyclopaedia, *Millennium and Millenarianism*. Published between 1907 and 1912. [www.catholic.com/encyclopedia/millennium-and-millenarianism](http://www.catholic.com/encyclopedia/millennium-and-millenarianism)
- Cyril J. Davey. *The Story of Sadhu Sundar Singh* (Chicago: Moody Press, 1963).
- Dhinakaran, D.G.S. *An Insight Into Heaven*. True Friend Management Support Service Pvt. Ltd. 2007.
- Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahido Church Holy Synod. *A short history, faith and order of the Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahido Church*, Canonical Books, Addis Ababa 1983, [www.ethiopianorthodox.org/english/canonical/books.html](http://www.ethiopianorthodox.org/english/canonical/books.html)
- Eusebius. *Ecclesiastical History*, Book 3, Chapter 36.  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/250103.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/250103.htm)
- Geoffrey W. Bromiley. *The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia*. Fully Revised Edition, Vol. 3, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids: Michigan, ISBN 0-8028-3783-2, 1986.
- G.H. Box. *Apocalypse of Abraham*. Society for promoting Christian Knowledge. London, Macmillan Company, 1919. [www.marquette.edu/maqom/box.pdf](http://www.marquette.edu/maqom/box.pdf)
- G.M. Hahneman. *The Muratorian Fragment and the Origins of the New Testament Canon in "The Canon Debate"* (ed. L. M. McDonald and J. A. Sanders, Massachusetts: Hendrickson, 2002), 405–415.

---

<sup>170</sup> Daniel 12 in *Brenton Septuagint translation* is [biblehub.com/sep/daniel/12.htm](http://biblehub.com/sep/daniel/12.htm)

- Klein, Reuven Chaim. "World Religions and the Noahide Prohibition of Idolatry" (PDF, 2022). Journal of Halacha and Contemporary Society. 79: 109–167.  
[hcommons.org/deposits/download/hc:50798/CONTENT/shituf-article.pdf](https://hcommons.org/deposits/download/hc:50798/CONTENT/shituf-article.pdf)
- LeRoy Edwin Froom. *The Conditionalist Faith of Our Fathers*, 2 vols. Washington, DC: Review and Herald, 1965.
- Louis Ginzberg, *Legends of the Jews*, Volume 1. The Jewish Publication Society, Philadelphia, 2003. [bibleresourcespart2.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/legends-of-the-jews-complete-in-2-volumes.pdf](https://bibleresourcespart2.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/legends-of-the-jews-complete-in-2-volumes.pdf)
- Paul Helm, *The Last Things: Death, Judgment, Heaven and Hell*. Carlisle, PA: Banner of Truth, 1989.
- R.H. Charles. *The Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha of the Old Testament*. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, UK, 1913.  
[www.ccel.org/c/charles/otpseudepig/enoch/ENOCH\\_2.HTM](http://www.ccel.org/c/charles/otpseudepig/enoch/ENOCH_2.HTM)
- Richard Bauckham. *Universalism: A Historical Survey*. Themelios 4, no. 2, January 1979.
- Sadhu Sundar Singh. *Visions of the Spiritual World*. Translated by Rev. T. E. Riddle of the New Zealand Presbyterian Mission, Kharar, Punjab, from Urdu into English, Macmillan Co., 1926.  
[endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/Visions\\_of\\_the\\_Spiritual\\_World\\_by\\_Sadhu\\_Sundar\\_Singh.pdf](http://endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/Visions_of_the_Spiritual_World_by_Sadhu_Sundar_Singh.pdf)
- Schaff, Philip. Ante-Nicene Fathers: NPNF2-14, Christian Literature Publishing Co, USA, 1885. *The Seven Ecumenical Councils*, 34.  
[www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/npnf214.html](http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/npnf214.html)
- Schaff, Philip. Ante-Nicene Fathers: Volume I, Christian Literature Publishing Co, USA, 1885. (St. Irenaeus of Lyons, *Against Heresies*, Book 4, Chapter 4).  
[www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf01.ix.vi.v.html](http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf01.ix.vi.v.html)
- Shepherd of Hermas*. Book 1, Vision 3. [www.newadvent.org/fathers/02011.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/02011.htm)
- Shepherd of Hermas*. Book 2, Commandment 1.  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/02012.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/02012.htm)
- St. Ambrose of Milan. *Exposition of the Christian Faith*. Book 5, Chapter 15.  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/34045.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/34045.htm)
- St. Athanasius the Great. *39th Festal Letter* (c. 367 AD).  
<http://www.ntcanon.org/Athanasius.shtml>
- St. Augustine of Hippo. *Catena Aurea*, Commentary on Matthew 25:1 – 13's Parable of the Five Wise/Foolish Virgins.  
[ccel.org/ccel/aquinas/catena1/catena1.ii.xxv.html](http://ccel.org/ccel/aquinas/catena1/catena1.ii.xxv.html)
- St. Augustine of Hippo. *Enchiridion*. "The Last Things", Chapter 29.  
[www.tertullian.org/fathers/augustine\\_enchiridion\\_02\\_trans.htm](http://www.tertullian.org/fathers/augustine_enchiridion_02_trans.htm)
- St. Clement of Alexandria. *The Stromata*, Book 6.  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/02106.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/02106.htm)
- St. Clement of Rome. *1 Clement*. [www.newadvent.org/fathers/1010.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/1010.htm)
- St. Gregory Nazianzus. *First Theological Oration* (Oration 27), Point IX.  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/310227.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/310227.htm)
- St. Gregory Nazianzus. *Oration 39*, Chapter XIX, Oration on the Holy Lights.  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/310239.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/310239.htm)
- St. Gregory Nazianzus. *Oration 40*, Chapter 13.  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/310240.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/310240.htm)
- St. Gregory Nazianzus. *Oration 40*, Chapter 36.  
[www.ewtn.com/catholicism/library/select-orations-334-3741-11647](http://www.ewtn.com/catholicism/library/select-orations-334-3741-11647)
- St. Irenaeus of Lyons. *Against Heresies*, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103224.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0103224.htm)
- St. Jerome of the Vulgate. *Commentary on Daniel*. Translated by Gleason L. Archer, 1958. [www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\\_daniel\\_02\\_text.htm](http://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome_daniel_02_text.htm)

## Jonathan Ramachandran

- St. Justin of Rome (Justin Martyr). *Dialogue with Trypho*,  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/01286.htm)
- St. Methodius of Olympus. *Banquet of the Ten Virgins*, Discourse 9, Chapter 5.  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/062309.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/062309.htm)
- St. Methodius of Olympus. *From the Discourse on the Resurrection*.  
[www.newadvent.org/fathers/0625.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0625.htm)
- St. Papias of Hierapolis, *Fragment V*. [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0125.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0125.htm) (3)
- St. Victorinus of Pettau. *Commentary on the Apocalypse*.  
[earlychurchrevival.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/11/st-victorinus-of-poetovio-translated-by-kevin-edgecomb.pdf](http://earlychurchrevival.wordpress.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/11/st-victorinus-of-poetovio-translated-by-kevin-edgecomb.pdf)
- Stephen J. Nichols. *Martin Luther's 95 Theses*. Presbyterian & Reformed Pub Co, USA, 2002.
- Streeter, Burnett and A. J. Appasamy. *The Sadhu: a Study in Mysticism and Practical Religion*. London: Macmillan, 1923.  
[endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/The\\_Sadhu-Streeter\\_and\\_Appasamy.pdf](http://endtimemanna.org/magnusson/Data/Sundar/The_Sadhu-Streeter_and_Appasamy.pdf)
- Strong, James. *Strong's Exhaustive Concordance*. 1890, public domain.  
[library.hugenote.com/Data/pdf/Strong's.pdf](http://library.hugenote.com/Data/pdf/Strong's.pdf)
- Swedenborg, Emanuel. *True Christian Religion*. [1771], tr. by John C. Ager [1906].  
[sacred-texts.com/swd/tcr/tcr17.htm](http://sacred-texts.com/swd/tcr/tcr17.htm)
- Tertullian. *Against Marcion*, [www.newadvent.org/fathers/03123.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/03123.htm)
- Tertullian. *On Modesty* ("De pudicitia"). [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0407.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0407.htm)
- Tertullian. *Prescription against Heretics*. [www.newadvent.org/fathers/0311.htm](http://www.newadvent.org/fathers/0311.htm)
- TeSelle, Eugene. *Augustine the Theologian*. Wipf and Stock (USA, ISBN 978-1-57910-918-9, 2002).